
UNIT 5 DEVELOPMENT DISCOURSES

Structure

- 5.1 Introduction
- 5.2 Objectives
- 5.3 Meanings of 'Development' Over Time
- 5.4 Emergence of Development and Modernization theories
 - 5.4.1 Theoretical bases of Modernization Theory
 - 5.4.2 Sociological version
 - 5.4.3 Psychological version
 - 5.4.4 Economic version
 - 5.4.5 The Critique of Modernization Theory
- 5.5 Underdevelopment Theory
 - 5.5.1 Frank's Thesis of the Development of Underdevelopment
 - 5.5.2 Wallerstein and the World Systems Theory
 - 5.5.3 Critique of Underdevelopment Theories
- 5.6 Summing Up
- 5.7 Glossary
- 5.8 Answers to Check Your Progress Exercises
- 5.9 References
- 5.10 Questions for Reflection and Practice

5.1 INTRODUCTION

This Unit is concerned with tracing the trajectory of the development discourse that came up mainly in the post-war period. The focus is on the critiques of the development and

modernization theories that were put forward by the underdevelopment theorists. The writings of underdevelopment theorists, especially the writings of André Gunder Frank and Immanuel Wallerstein are taken up. The attempt will be to summarize the theoretical perspectives of André Gunder Frank and Immanuel Wallerstein and trace the critiques that emerged subsequently.

5.2 OBJECTIVES

After studying this Unit, you should be able to

- define the concepts of development and modernization;
- clarify the theoretical bases of modernization theory; and
- evaluate underdevelopment theories.

5.3 MEANINGS OF ‘DEVELOPMENT’ OVER TIME

The word ‘development’ has carried very different meanings over time. In its present sense, the term ‘development’ can be dated to the post-war era of modern development thinking. The antecedents of development policy can be traced to the work of classical political economists from Ricardo to Marx, as they addressed similar problems of economic development. With the turn of the century and with the Cold War years, the central planning of the Soviet, Chinese or Cuban varieties was a competing development strategy. Thus the core meaning of development, within this general context, was catching up with the advanced industrialized countries.

Another meaning of development, according to Crowen and Shenton, was its reference in 19th century England, to remedies for the shortcomings and problems of progress such as population, job loss, the social question and urban squalor. Here progress and development are contrasted. Thus in the 20th century, development thinking in Europe and its colonies had already covered various areas and positions and was a reaction to 19th century progress and failures of industrialization policy that left people uprooted and jobless along with disrupted social relations.

Modern development economics was immediately preceded by colonial economics. In the European colonies, development referred mainly to colonial resource management for the benefit of industries in the metropolitan countries. Industrialization of the colonies was not a part of colonial economics. In fact, as amply documented, colonial interests destroyed many native manufactures like the textile manufacturing in India. This is an important difference between colonial economies and the economies of Central and Eastern Europe.

In modern development thinking and economics, development referred mainly to economic growth as in Rostow's *Stages of Growth* that covered mechanization and industrialization. With the broadening of development thinking to cover modernization, economic growth was combined with political modernization. In dependency theory, development mainly meant economic growth, under the heading of accumulation. In its distorted form, accumulation meant dependent accumulation which led to the 'development of underdevelopment'. With the beginning of alternative development thinking, new understandings of development came up that focused on social and community development. In the mid 1980s, following Amartya Sen's work on capacities and entitlements, human development focused on development as capacitation. According to this view, development is seen as enabling. The Human Development Reports of the UNDP define development as 'the enlargement of people's choices'.

Box 1: Human Development and Capability Approach

Amartya Sen:

The Human Development approach has been profoundly inspired by Amartya Sen's Pioneering works in welfare economics, social choice, poverty and famine and development economics. His capability approach has provided paradigm in social science and contributed to Human Development. In his book *Inequality re-examined* he says "a person's capability to achieve functioning that he or she has reason to value provides a general approach to the evaluation of social arrangements, and this yields a particular way of viewing the assessment of equality and inequality". Capability approach is a broad normative framework which evaluates the social arrangements and the extent of freedom people have to promote or achieve functioning they value. It examines what people are actually able to do, the range of alternatives they face while doing the function they value and to what extent they make decisions that matter to them.

Martha Nussbaum:

She has proposed a list of ten central human capabilities and said that these should be the basis of constitutional guarantees. Nussbaum explains her work on capabilities as providing citizens with a justification and arguments for constitutional principles that citizens have a right to demand from their government. As such, her work on the capability approach is universalistic, as she argues all governments should endorse these capabilities. She grounds her vision of the capability approach on what she calls an internalist essentialist position. Her list of central human capabilities are Life, bodily health, bodily integrity, senses, imagination and thought, emotions, practical reason, affiliation, other species, play and control over one's environment. Nussbaum develops three categories of capability that are different from Sen's. Basic capabilities are innate

abilities. Internal capabilities are states of a person that enable him/her to exercise a specific capability, if the circumstances and constraints allow this exercise. Combined capabilities are the internal capabilities together with the external provisions that effectively enable the person to exercise the capability.

Around the same time two radically different perspectives on development came up. One perspective was of neo-liberalism that argues against the notion of developing economies representing a ‘special case’. They argue against development that involves government intervention. Instead they support market forces. Economic growth is to be achieved through structural reforms, deregulation, liberalization and privatization. All of these reduce government intervention and in effect cancel development. While the core meaning of development i.e, economic growth, is retained, the agency of development shifts from state to market. Hence in terms of means not in terms of goals, neo-liberalism is an anti-development perspective. The second perspective is of post-development that also puts forward an anti-development position. According to this radical perspective, the government is charged with authoritarian interventions, economic growth is rejected and the results are considered a failure for the majority of the population.

Table No 5.1 Meaning of Development over a period of time

Period	Perspective	Meaning
1817	Late comers	Industrialization, catching
1850	colonial economy	resource management, trusteeship
1940	development economic	growth-industrialization
1950	modernization theory growth	political and social

		modernization
1960	Dependency theory	Accumulation-national, auto centric
1970	alternative development	human flourishing
1980	human development	Capacitization, enlargement of people choices
1980	neoliberalism	economic growth-structural reform, deregulation, liberalization, privatization
1990	post development	authoritarian, engineering, disaster

Source: Pieterse, J. N., Development Theory: Deconstructions/ Reconstructions. London: Sage Publications, 2001

Thus development has a mixed lineage. It includes the application of science and technology to collective organizations as well as the changes that arise due to the application of that technology. Development ranges from infrastructure projects to industrial policy, the welfare state and the new economic policy. The different meanings of development relate to changing relations of power and hegemony.

Check Your Progress Exercise 1

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. How does UNDP define Development?

5.4 EMERGENCE OF DEVELOPMENT AND MODERNIZATION THEORIES

The theories of development are closely tied up with the evolution of the capitalist system that can be divided into three main stages. First is the Age of Competitive Capitalism (1700-1860) represented by Adam Smith and David Ricardo, the main representatives of classical political economy and the historical materialism of Marx and Engels. Second is the Age of Imperialism (1860-1945) represented by neo-classical political economy and the classical theory of imperialism. Third is the period of Late Capitalism (1945-today) represented by theories of modernization and the dependency theories.

After the Second World War the process of decolonization and the widespread poverty of the newly developing nations became important problems for social theorists and economists. A new consciousness emerged about the plight and development needs of so many peoples, partly because of the vastness of the problem and the way it could adversely affect the developed world itself and partly also due to political considerations about the appeal of Russian socialist experience.

During the post-war period, in the capitalist world, the theories of development were known as modernization theories i.e. as theories of the processes and stages through which traditional or backward societies were bound to go during their transition to modern society. It was assumed that the newly developing societies must go through the same stages of development as in the developed societies. The modernization theorist believed in continuity and unidirectional transition of society. However, they do not take the process of economic

development for granted nor do they abstract from social and political variables. Concerns similar to the classical political economists like the exploration and study of the institutional arrangements, values and class structures that make development possible are reintroduced.

Along with the birth of the sociology of development, the studies of social and political processes that favour or hinder economic development acquire new significance. At this time modernization theories dominated the academic world.

5.4.1 Theoretical Bases of Modernization Theory

Modernization theories begin with an implicit or explicit reference to a dichotomy between two ideal types-- the traditional society also called rural, backward or underdeveloped society; and the modern society also called urban, developed or industrial society. The two ideal types of social structure are believed to be historically connected by a continuing evolutionary process that follows certain general laws. It is argued that all societies follow a similar historical course that becomes more differentiated and complex as it moves from one polar type to another. Traditional societies are supposed to follow a pattern of development similar to the developed nations. Modernization theories, therefore, seek to identify the social variables and institutional factors whose change was crucial for the process of development, in order to facilitate the process for newly developing countries.

Some of the modernization theories emphasize the role of a wide variety of social and institutional variables and carry out a social analysis of the transition. Other theories highlight the complex interaction of many variables, but privilege the role of one special factor or level. Thus some theories underline economic factors, while others stress the principal role of psychological factors.

5.4.2 Sociological Version

Within the social sciences, there is a long tradition of the idea of transition between two polar types of society. For example the distinction made by Tonnies between *Gemeinschaft* (community or association) and *Gesellschaft* (society or organization); Spencer's dichotomy between homogeneous and heterogeneous society; and Durkheim's opposition between mechanical solidarity and organic solidarity. The movement between the two poles, i.e. development, was understood in terms of certain stages within which important processes of specialization and differentiation occurred, increasing the complexity of society. Compared to modern societies, traditional societies were considered to be very 'simple'.

In the post-war period, Talcott Parson's theories of modernization were most influential. Parsons reinterpreted Weber's classification of an ideal type of traditional society - with predominance of traditional type of action (action determined by custom) and a traditional type of authority; and an ideal type of modern or rational society - predominance of goal-oriented rational actions, legal authority based on impersonal norms e.g. bureaucratic rule.

Parsons developed this approach by arguing that social relations can be determined in terms of five dimensions which present polar alternatives i.e. pattern variables - which help to describe the ideal, typical social structure of 'traditional' and 'modern' societies. The pattern variables are: (i) Affectivity vs. affective neutrality which concerns the amount of emotion that is appropriate in a given interaction situation; (ii) Diffuseness vs. specificity which denotes the issue of how far reaching obligations in an interaction situation are to be; (iii) Universalism vs. particularism which concerns the problem of whether evaluation and judgement of others in an interaction situation is to apply to all actors or whether all actors

should be assessed in terms of the same standards; (iv) Achievement vs. ascription which concerns the problem of assessing actors in terms of performance or on the basis of inborn qualities such as sex, age, race, family status; (v) Self vs. collectivity concerning the extent to which action is to be oriented to self interest and individual goals or to group interests and goals.

Parsons claims that in traditional societies roles tend to be ascriptive, diffuse, particularistic and affective. In modern industrial societies on the contrary, roles which are performance-oriented, universalistic, affectively neutral and specific tend to predominate. He leaves out the last pattern variable because of difficulties in making a clear cut argument. The social structure of a traditional society, Parsons Calls 'ascriptive- particularistic' while social structure of industrial society is called 'acquisitive- universalistic'. The transition from traditional society to industrial society supposes a progressive expansion of sphere of application of roles of the latter type and a contraction of sphere of application of roles of the former type.

Many authors have followed Parson's pattern variables with some alterations.

Hoselitz, for example, discards the pattern variable of Affectivity vs. affective neutrality as without relevance and emphasizes the alternative, 'orientation towards collective or private interests'. For the process of transition and its mechanisms, Hoselitz resorts to the theory of social deviance-- of the innovating entrepreneur- - who is the prototype of the social deviant, the person most suited to make innovations and creative adjustments in situations of change. He is the dynamic force behind the process of transition to modernity.

5.4.3 The Psychological Version

This version emphasizes the psychological motives and other 'internal factors' which are supposed to be the motor forces of economic growth. David McClelland emphasizes the values and motives men have to lead them to exploit opportunities, to take advantage of favourable trade conditions i.e. to shape one's own destiny. However, he does not deny the importance of 'external factors' and objective conditions in the development process. Through a content analysis of written fantasies (including children's stories) he isolated the motives that influence the behaviour of individuals. He discovered the 'need for achievement' ('n' achievement), defined as 'a desire to do well, not only for sake of social recognition or prestige, but to attain an inner feeling of personal accomplishment'. McClelland gathered evidence from European industrial revolution and modern Japan and ancient Greece to show that this relationship is a general one. He puts forward the idea that the link between high concentration of 'n' achievement and economic development is the business entrepreneur-- who is prepared to take moderate risks and innovate. He argues that motivation to do well is not hereditary or innate, but children acquire it early in life. This means that 'n' achievement can be raised in a country by means of education so that more children can acquire the 'entrepreneurial desire'.

5.4.4 The Economic Version

This version emphasizes the economic factors in the process of transition. The main representative of this approach is W.W. Rostow's stages of economic growth. Rostow proposes that all societies pass through five stages- -traditional society, pre-conditions for take-off, take-off, road to maturity and age of high mass consumption. The characteristic features of traditional society are largely agricultural societies with low productivity and pre-

Newtonian attitude in respect of the physical world. There is a ceiling to growth determined by lack of technology. Power is in the hands of landowners and the value system is fatalistic.

In the next stage, pre-conditions for take-off, the process of transition begins, like in England, then Western Europe. But in most countries, it is externally induced by advanced countries which accelerated destruction of those traditional societies. Many economic changes are introduced, but the most significant is the political constitution of the nation-state. The take-off stage is the moment when growth becomes a permanent feature of society. Rate of investment goes up; more and new industries expand rapidly, new techniques are introduced in industry and agriculture which secure constant growth. During the next long period of the road to maturity, every aspect of the economy is modernized and makes use of new technology; imports are substituted and exports expand; and industrial diversification takes place. In the final stage, society is characterized by high mass consumption with an orientation of the economy to consumer durables and services. With high per capita incomes, consumption expands beyond basic needs. Welfare and social security become important goals that compete for resources. The increase in military expenditure reflects a new search for influence and power in the international arena.

Rostow argues that two major advantages which nations that took off first did not have was (i) the existence of an already developed modern technology that is available to underdeveloped countries; (ii) the international aid and technical assistance provided by developed countries. For Rostow, communism was a disease of the process of transition that takes advantage of conflicts and problems which developed nations confront at the stage of precondition for take off in order to seize power. This is why he sees it as essential that USA should commit itself to support, aid and protect the modernization processes occurring in Latin America, Africa, Asia and Middle East. Rostow's idea is that once societies in transition pass from precondition for take-off, the natural difficulties and problems of

modernization diminish and more stable democracies can be set up within the 'free world'. For Rostow, the security of U.S.A. depended on the process of modernization being conducted in such a way that no developed nation goes communist.

5.4.5 The Critique of Modernization Theory

Up to the mid 1960s, modernization theories which included a variety of perspectives were used to understand "Third World" societies. The crux of the modernization theories as put forward by Talcott Parsons, Daniel Lerner, D. McClelland, Rostow and others, was that development involved industrial growth which was autonomous and self-sustaining. This form of development, which had occurred in the West, was assumed to be a role model for the rest of the world to follow. There was a kind of economic determinism involved, as development was measured mainly in terms of growth in GNP. The modernization theorists stressed the idea of the existence of 'dual societies'. They pointed out that the underdeveloped societies had both a traditional and a modern sector. Gradually the traditional sector is modernized, economically, politically as well as socially. Besides industrial development, some theorists also focused on the importance of social and cultural factors in the process of modernization. The role of values, culture, individuals or elites was stressed, as giving the impetus to modernize. Thus, on the whole, modernization theories argued that capitalism played a progressive role in the development of traditional and underdeveloped societies.

Modernization theories have been criticized by A.G. Frank for their theoretical inadequacy, empirical validity and their policy effectiveness. Modernization theories have been criticized for the abstract and ahistorical manner in which institutional and social aspects that influence the development process have been introduced. They reduce the study of socio-historical processes to the construction of abstract models that are universally

applicable. In David McClelland's psychological approach, development is reduced to the existence of certain motivation, the need for achievement, the desire to do well. Historical differences are completely neglected for the sake of a general theory.

Modernization theories are caught in a theoretical dilemma. On the one hand they argue that the developing countries must follow the same path as the developed nations where development was mainly due to endogenous forces. On the other hand, in order to explain internal processes of change in underdeveloped countries, they are forced to acknowledge that their situation is different. Changes must happen internally but they are induced from abroad. Thus the modernization theories breach their own premise that the path to development is the same for all countries.

Check Your Progress Exercise 2

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. List the theoretical bases of Modernization Theory.

5.5 UNDERDEVELOPMENT THEORY

By the late 1960s and early 1970s there was a growing disillusionment with modernization theories. Their inability to explain the failure of capitalist development in different parts of the world led to the rise of an alternative theory, namely underdevelopment theory (variously known as dependency or world systems theory). The underdevelopment or dependency theories arose as a challenge to the modernization theories which failed to provide a convincing explanation of the backwardness of the “third world” countries, especially the Latin American countries.

After the Second World War, the United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America (ECLA) was established. The ECLA espoused an “inward-looking” development path as against the earlier, “outward-looking” development path, as a solution to Latin America’s backwardness.

By the 1960s however, it had become clear that the ‘inward-looking’ development path or ‘import-substitution’, industrialization had failed in its aim of developing the Latin American countries. It had, in fact, resulted in the increased dependence, marginalization and cultural alienation of Latin America. Multinational corporations were inextricably linked with the industrial development of the country. Gradually military governments were established in many of the Latin American countries. Dependency theories of the Marxist perspective arose as an attempt to explain this failure.

There are a variety of perspectives within dependency theory like, the ECLA structuralist perspective, the Marxist perspective, etc. Those theorists linked with the structuralist perspective are – Osvaldo Sunkel, Celso Furtado, and those of the Marxist perspective are R.H. Marini, Theotonio Dos Santos, and A.G. Frank. The contribution of André Gunder Frank to the development and popularization of dependency theory has been

immense. We will now concentrate on the critique of modernization theory as espoused by A.G. Frank.

In order to understand the failure of the Latin American countries to develop, Frank espoused the underdevelopment/dependency theory. His theory, for the first time showed an interest in the analysis of the underdeveloped, “Third World” countries themselves unlike the theory of imperialism as espoused by Lenin and others which concentrated on the developed countries.

5.5.1 Frank’s Thesis of the Development of Underdevelopment

Though Frank was not the originator of underdevelopment theory, he popularized it. He was greatly influenced by Paul Baran’s work, “The Political Economy of Growth” (first published, 1957) as well as by the ECLA perspective.

In one of his most important works – “Capitalism and Underdevelopment in Latin America” (1967) – Frank holds capitalism responsible for underdevelopment in the “third world” countries. He begins the book with the sentence –

“I believe, with Paul Baran, that it is capitalism, both world and national, which produced under-development in the past and which still generates under-development in the present”

Frank notes that capitalist expansion in Europe led to the incorporation of the whole world into a single international system. Characterized by monopoly and exploitation, the capitalist world economy has penetrated deep into the Latin American economy leading to development, in some areas and to the development of underdevelopment in others. This is because the world system is divided into a chain of metropolis-satellite relations. The

metropolis exploits the satellite and the surplus appropriated by the metropolis is not re-invested in the satellite. Thus development in the satellite is stunted or slowed down.

Through a historical study of Chile and Brazil, Frank tries to show that since the 16th century they were colonized. These two countries have underdeveloped and have become the peripheral satellite of the European metropolis. He notes that:

“The monopoly capitalist structure and the surplus expropriation/appropriation contradiction run through the entire Chilean economy, past and present. It is this exploitation relation which in chain-like fashion extends the capitalist link between the capitalist world and national metropolises to the regional centres (part of whose surplus they appropriate) and so on to large landholders or merchants who appropriate surplus from small peasants or tenants, and sometimes even from the latter to landless labourers exploited by them in turn. At each point, the international, national and local capitalist system generates economic development for the few and underdevelopment for the many” .

Similarly, about Brazil, Frank points out that the world system is divided into “a whole chain of metropolises and satellites, which runs from the world metropolis down to the hacienda or rural merchants who are satellites of the local commercial metropolitan centre, but who in their turn have peasants as their satellites”.

The entire system has a monopolistic structure which involves the misuse and squandering of resources throughout the system. This misuse involves mainly “The expropriation and appropriation of a large part or even all of and more than the economic surplus or surplus value of the satellite by its local, regional, national or international metropolis”. Finally, it is the imperialist, metropolitan centre that appropriates all the surplus and resources extracted from the various satellites in the metropolitan satellite chain. This capitalist expansion, however, generates the continuous development of the metropolises and

the continuous under-development of the satellites. Besides, the development of the metropolis can occur only through the underdevelopment of the periphery. As Frank puts it, “development and underdevelopment each cause and are caused by the other in the total development of capitalism”.

The metropolis-satellite relations involve the following aspects: First, the satellites' economic, political, social and cultural structures are closely tied to those of the metropolis. Second, a metropolis, which is also an international satellite, does not have autonomous development. It experiences underdeveloped development. Third, when the ties between the metropolis and satellite are weak, the satellite may experience local, autonomous development. Fourth, when the ties between the metropolis and satellite are strengthened, there may be a renewal of underdeveloped development in the satellite. Therefore, the underdevelopment of the satellites occurred at the same time as development of the metropolises. As Frank puts it, “(Underdevelopment) developed right along with economic development and it is still doing so”.

Frank rejected the argument that the agricultural sector or any other part of Latin America could be considered ‘feudal’ or pre-capitalist. He rejected the idea that underdeveloped societies are made up of two economies, the modern and the traditional. He notes that in reality, it is one sub-system of a global economy. Analyzing the case of Brazil, he argues that “...No part of Brazil, certainly no populous part, forms a closed, or even an historically isolated, system. None of it can, therefore, in the most essential respect be feudal. He points out that capitalism has penetrated into the very heart of the Latin American economy. Even those areas that were mainly based on a self-sufficient, subsistence, economy were according to Frank, the results of the decline of earlier export-oriented industries. The ‘latifundias’ too, which came up as a response to commercial opportunities, have declined into isolation.

He cites the example of the Brazilian North-East whose sugar exports declined by the end of the 17th century. “The relative weakening of its ties with the metropolis forced the Northeast to turn it upon itself; the development of the system as a whole produced the involution of its Northeast Brazilian satellite”.

Therefore, what at face value appears to be feudal or pre-capitalist features, are essentially the consequences of underdeveloped capitalism. Frank also disagreed that the Latin American native Indian populations could be defined in terms of economic isolation or lack of cultural integration. He argued that “the expansion and development of capitalism incorporated the native Indian population into its exploitative monopoly structure immediately upon conquest”. For example, the satellite which is at the same time a national metropolis generated a satellite economy of its own: livestock raising.

The satellite livestock economy formed a metropolis, in turn, with respect to the native Indian zones into which its expansion forced the native Indians to withdraw and/or to serve as a source of exploited labour power. The European metropolis thus affected the life of the interior through a long chain of metropolises and satellites (Frank, 1967: 154).

One of the first systems of exploitation of the native Indians by the colonialists was slavery and the ‘encomienda’(The encomienda was a servile system whereby a group of Indians was allocated to a Spanish conquistador who had the right to exact tribute from them, in goods, money or personal services in his lands or mines during part of the year). In the book ‘Dependent Accumulation and Underdevelopment’ (1978), Frank details the various modes of production like the encomienda, yeoman farming, slave plantations, etc. in the different colonies. However he argues that their analysis: “must begin with an examination of the historical process of capital accumulation on a world scale since that was the driving force of the various processes in The New World”.

Besides the working of the exploitative metropolis satellite chain which causes the 'development of underdevelopment', there is another important factor that leads to uneven development in the satellite. Frank notes that it is the transfer of surplus from the satellite to the metropolis that leads to distorted development in the satellite. An important aspect of the monopolistic structure which squanders resources is 'the expropriation and appropriation of a large part or even all of or more than the economic surplus or surplus value of the satellite by its local, regional, national or international metropolis'.

Finally, it is the imperialist metropolis at the end of the metropolis-satellite chain that appropriates all the resources. Hence Frank is of the opinion that the expansion of the capitalist system leads to the continuous development of the metropolises and to the continuous underdevelopment of the satellites. He also points out that 'development and underdevelopment each cause and are caused by the other in the total development of capitalism'.

Finally, Frank emphasized the political consequences of dependency. He argued that the ruling classes have a vested interest in maintaining the exploitative and monopolistic capitalist structure that runs in chain-like fashion from the villages to the imperialist metropolis.

In 'Lumpen bourgeoisie: Lumpen development' (1972), he points out that, 'This colonial and class structure establishes very well defined class interests for the dominant sector of the bourgeoisie. Using government cabinets and other instruments of the state, the bourgeoisie produces a policy of underdevelopment in the economic, social and political life of the 'nation' and the people of Latin America.

Frank's argument is best illustrated by an analysis of the period after Latin American independence in the 19th century. To sum up, Frank notes that the "European" lumpen

bourgeoisie built “national” lumpen states which never achieved real independence, but were, and are, simply effective instruments of the lumpen bourgeoisie’s policy of lumpen development’.

Frank stresses the importance of state policy in economic development. He points out that state policy is the result of the conflicting interests of classes and sub-classes who benefit from perpetuating the existing economic structure and who are in a strong position to succeed. For Frank, the only way to break out of the monopolistic capitalist system is to have a world-wide socialist revolution. This revolution is to be led by the socialist countries.

5.5.2 Wallerstein and the World Systems Theory

Another underdevelopment or world systems theorist who argues much on the same lines as Frank, is Immanuel Wallerstein. We will now attempt to summarize Wallerstein’s main arguments and then move on to a critique of both Frank and Wallerstein.

Wallerstein begins his analysis of the capitalist system by insisting that any social system must be seen as a totality. He also emphasizes that nation states in the modern world are not closed systems and should not be treated as such. They, in fact, have a single division of labour but with various sectors or areas that are economically dependent on each other for their needs.

The only social systems that have existed are ‘mini-systems’ (closed local economies) ‘world empires’ (characterized by the extraction of tribute by a central authority) and ‘world economies’ (formed by market exchange). The modern world economy is not completely open as various political and cultural differences and interests interfere. But it is a unit with a single division of labour and multiple cultural systems’. For Wallerstein then, the modern world system is characterized by the capitalist world economy. He notes that ‘capitalism and

a world economy (that is a single division of labour but multiple polities) are obverse sides of the same coin. One does not cause the other.

Wallerstein suggests that capitalism as a system began from the middle of the 15th century. It developed in four distinct historical stages – 1450-1640, 1650-1730, 1760-1917 and 1917 and after, as the period of consolidation. He circumvents the ‘problem’ of the transition of capitalism and feudalism. This follows from his definition of capitalism, which is characterized by ‘production for sale in a market ... to realize the minimum profit’.

The capitalist world system, for Wallerstein, is not based on the Frankian model of dichotomy between the metropolis and the satellite. Wallerstein distinguishes between three tiers of states within the world economy. They include the core, the semi-periphery and the periphery. The main difference between them is the difference in state power resulting in the appropriation of surplus from the periphery to the core. Consequently, the core develops strong state machinery which serves as a mechanism to protect disparities that have arisen within the world system. This transfer of surplus from the periphery to the core leads to the underdevelopment of the former and development of the latter. The periphery is characterized by weak states, mono-agriculture and the export of low-wage goods. The semi-periphery represents a buffer zone between the core and the periphery. This zone is crucial for the working of the world economy, in the sense that it stabilizes the tensions between the core and the periphery. Without this zone, the world system gets polarized and may revolt. The semi-periphery has a dual role to play i.e. it is the periphery to the core as well as the core to the periphery. It is the arena for change, new core states can arise from the semi-periphery and declining core states can fall into it. The state in the semi-periphery has an important role to play. It controls the ‘economic decisions’ and is the main arena for the international market.

Like Frank, Wallerstein too points to the unequal exchange between the core and periphery as the reason for the development of core states and underdevelopment of peripheral states. He argues that all the empires in the past, collected tributes, whereas the modern world economy had developed 'an alternative and more lucrative source of surplus appropriation'. '... (T)he modern world invented the technology that makes it possible to increase the flow of the surplus from the lower strata to the upper strata, from the periphery to the centre, from the majority to the minority, by eliminating the 'waste' of too cumbersome a political superstructure'.

This flow of surplus from the periphery to the core is assisted by the international division of labour and the political power. This transfer of surplus from the periphery and semi-periphery to the core due to unequal exchange has resulted in the underdevelopment of the former and development of the latter.

Among the World system theorists, there is a tendency in Wallerstein, to give secondary importance to the internal socio-economic structures. Wallerstein argues that besides social class, there are a number of other grounds for collective action. He subsumes the others under the general term of 'ethno-nations' that includes nations, nationalities, peoples and ethnic groups. Although class interests cross political boundaries there is a constant conflict of interests between specific groups (classes or ethno-nations) within them who try to create special spheres of influence within the world market. He notes that the 'external' bourgeoisie based in the core countries, operating through transnationals, have considerable influence in the semi-periphery.

Thus, he notes that though class conflict is an international phenomenon at the periphery, it may be blurred due to alternative forms of association. This is mainly because, 'the primary contradiction is between the interests organized and located in the core countries

and their local allies on the one hand and the majority of the population on the other. In point of fact then, an anti-imperialist nationalist struggle is, in fact, a mode of expression of class-interest'. Overall, Wallerstein asserts that the world system must be analyzed as a whole. The entire world is treated as its basic unit of analysis.

Finally, Wallerstein is of the opinion that in order to overcome the problems brought about by the capitalist world system, it is not enough to have state ownership, self reliance and 'socialism in one country'. "Production for use and not for profit and rational decisions on the cost-benefits (in the widest sense of the term) of alternative uses is a different mode of production, one that can only be established within the single division of labour that is the world economy and one that will require a single government". To state it briefly, for real socialism, a completely new world system is required.

5.5.3 Critique of Underdevelopment Theories

One of the strongest critics of Frank and Wallerstein, was the Marxist writer, Ernesto Laclau. His article, "Feudalism and Capitalism in Latin America" (1971) has led to much debate. Laclau has pointed out that both Frank and Wallerstein define capitalism in terms of exchange relations. They totally ignore the relations of production. Thus capitalism looks like a system of production that is geared to the market and feudalism has weak contacts with the outside world.

However, Laclau notes that orientation to the market is not the only characteristic of capitalism. The different modes of production and economic systems must be taken into consideration. The point is that an economic system can include as constituent elements, different modes of production.

According to Anthony Brewer, another Marxist scholar, both Frank and Wallerstein are looking for 'descriptive generalizations based on directly observed facts'. For Marx, by contrast, 'the capitalist mode of production was not a directly observable thing; it was instead a conceptual object, the product of thought'.

The most distinctive contribution of Frank, the idea of a chain of metropolis-satellite relations that exist at all levels in the world system, has also been critiqued by Brewer. He argues that Frank has fused together very different kinds of relations on the basis of purely superficial similarities. He also points out that monopoly relations exist at various levels and that different kinds of monopoly exist. However, Frank does not distinguish between them.

Furthermore, Brewer critiques Frank's attempt at the concurrence of an economic hierarchy of individuals or classes with a spatial or geographic hierarchy. He feels that this coincidence of economic and spatial relations may not be universal like for example – between monopoly merchant capital and monopoly modern capital.

Brewer also critiques Frank for using the term dependence in a number of senses – political dependence, economic dependence, etc. He argues that no part of the world now can be regarded as independent. It is the process of capitalism, which shapes both the dominant and dominated countries.

The main contention of these Marxist critics is that at both theoretical and empirical levels the World System theorists do not put forward a pure version of Marxism. The World System theorists argue that in the 15th and 16th century with the expansion of the West, began the incorporation of the rest of the world into the capitalist world system. This would imply that the capitalist world system existed much before the industrial revolution had taken place. However, Laclau argues that incorporation into the Western capitalist system is not the same as espousing the capitalist mode of production. He notes that Frank and Wallerstein have

ignored the relations of production in their attempt to define capitalism as profit motivated production for the market. They have also tended to confuse capitalism with the existence of an economic system.

Similarly, Robert Brenner (1977) has adopted a more comprehensive position regarding Frank and Wallerstein's definition of capitalism. He argues that a market-based definition of capitalism is incorrect. It should be considered as a system of production based on the exploitation of free wage labour. The driving force of development, according to this view, is not just the market, but rather, the class relationship which is the result of class conflict. Thus Brenner challenges the idea of the World System theorists, that development and underdevelopment are causally related through unequal exchange. The significance of class struggle is also noted by Leys, Petras and Phillips. They all accuse World System theorists of neglecting the process of class formation and class struggle .

At a more empirical level, the Warrenites unlike other neo-Marxists claim that the empirical evidences prove that since World War II, growth rates in many parts of the Third World have been higher than in the developed countries.) claim that the main cause of underdevelopment in the Third World countries does not lie in its relationship with the West. Rather, it is the internal contradictions of the "Third World" which is the main obstacle to capitalist development there. The Warrenites also argue that capitalist development has always been uneven and point out that the Third World should not be treated as one bloc.

The Marxist critics argue that the World systems theorists are not clear in the use and treatment of concepts such as capitalism, feudalism, modes of production, exploitation, etc. This ultimately serves the interests of the Third World elites and also disguises the international aspects of class struggle.

The non-Marxists argue that theoretically, the World System theory is tautological. They argue that all Third World societies have been permeated by capitalism, even those societies which do not have a colonial history. Thus there are no exceptional cases. It is pointed out that the World system theorists justifiably emphasize the importance of international economic structures which have been ignored by modernization theorists. However, it is argued, that culture, which has international significance, has been relatively underplayed.

Finally, the non-marxists totally agree with the Marxist critics that the “Third World” societies can develop in close connection with the development of core societies. They argue against the Frankian thesis that development occurs in the periphery only when its links with the core are weak or broken. In fact, they argue like Platt, an economic historian, that underdevelopment of the periphery increases when these ties are broken .

5.6 SUMMING UP

In this Unit we have discussed three major theories in the development discourse and these are gender blind and due consideration is not given to the problems faced by women. In the next Unit one would be looking at the feminist critique of development theories.

Check Your Progress Exercise 3

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. Identify the causes of rise of Underdevelopment Theory.

5.7 GLOSSARY

Human Development: The concept of Human Development is not a new invention but a rediscovery and it is tribute to the philosophers of early political and economic thought. The underlying philosophy of human development is strengthening human capabilities and functionings, emphasis on human rights and concern for equity and justice. Mahabub ul Haq along with Amartya Sen rediscovered this human development approach. The perspective of human development incorporates the need to remove the hindrances that people face through the efforts and initiatives of people themselves. The objective of development is to create an enabling environment for people to enjoy long, healthy and creative lives.

Liberalization: Liberty to establish any kind of economic activity in a country without restrictions from public and private sphere.

Privatization: Privatization is the transfer of government assets or services to the private sector. State-owned assets may be sold to private owners, or statutory restrictions on competition between privately and publicly owned enterprises may be lifted. Services formerly provided by government may be contracted out.

Structural Reform: Structural reform is an effort undertaken to create accountable, transparent government with a well-defined public and private sector working in mutual reinforcing ways to promote prosperity and sustainable development.

Imperialism: Imperialism is the policy of expanding a nation's authority over other countries by acquiring their territory forcefully and controlling their economic and political activity.

5.8 ANSWERS TO CHECK YOUR PROGRESS EXERCISES

Check Your Progress Exercise 1.

1. UNDP defines development as “enlargement of people's choices”.

Check Your Progress 2.

1. There are three bases of modernization theory. They are sociological, psychological and economic bases.

Check Your Progress 3.

1. Growing disillusionment with modernization theory, failure of capitalist development, backwardness of developing countries, and failure of industrialization.

5.9 REFERENCES

Brewer, A, *Marxist Theories of Imperialism: A Critical Survey*, 2nd Edition, London: Routledge, 1990.

Cowen, M.P. and R.W. Shenton, *Doctrines of Development*, London. Routledge, 1996.

Frank, A.G, *Capitalism and Underdevelopment in Latin America*, New York: Monthly Review Press, 1967.

_____, *Latin America: Underdevelopment of Revolution*, New York: Monthly Review Press, 1969.

_____ *Lumpenbourgeoisie: Lumpendevlopment Dependence, Class and Politics in Latin America*, New York: Monthly Review Press, 1972.

_____ *Dependent Accumulation and Underdevelopment*, London: Macmillan, 1978.

Harrison, D, *The Sociology of Modernization and Development*, New Delhi: Heritage Publications, 1988.

Larrain, J, *Theories of Development: Capitalism, Colonialism and Dependency*, London: Polity Press, 1989.

O'Brien, P.J, "A critique of Latin American Theories of Dependency", In Oxall, I.T., Barnett and D. Booth, eds. *Beyond the Sociology of Development: Economy and Society in Latin America and Africa*, London: Routledge and Kegan Pau. 1975l.

Pieterse, J. N., *Development Theory: Deconstructions/ Reconstructions*, London: Sage Publications, 2001.

Wallerstein, I. *The Modern World System*, New York: Academic Press, 1974.

_____, *The Capitalist World Economy*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press,
1979.

5.10 QUESTIONS FOR REFLECTION AND PRACTICE

1. Describe the emergence of development and modernization theories.
2. Differentiate between the theoretical basis of modernization theories.
3. Identify the causes of the rise of underdevelopment theories.
4. Critically analyze the underdevelopment theories of A.G. Frank and I. Wallerstein.

UNIT 6 WID-WAD-GAD – PART I

Structure

6.1 Introduction

6.2 Objectives

6.3 Concepts of Development and Underdevelopment

6.4 Boserup's Thesis

6.4.1 Critique of Boserup

6.5 Emergence of Women in Development (WID) Approach

6.5.1 Welfare approach

6.5.2 Equity approach

6.6 Three World Conferences on Women

6.6.1 Anti- Poverty approach

6.6.2 Efficiency approach

6.7 Women and Development (WAD) Approach

6.7.1 Empowerment approach

6.7.2 The Indian Context

6.8 Critique of WID

6.9 Gender and Development (GAD) Approach

6.10 Fourth World Conference on Women

6.11 Summing Up

6.12 Glossary

6.13 Answers to Check Your Progress Exercise

6.14 References

6.15 Questions for Reflection and Practice

6.1 INTRODUCTION

Ever since the formation of the United Nations Commission on the Status for Women in 1946, it had been proposing a U. N. Women's Conference with little success. Gradually with pressure from the American Women's Movement, the U.N. General Assembly declared 1975 as the International Women's Year and 1975-1985 as the International Decade for Women. This declaration led to a growing awareness of women's issues and an acceptance of their demands as legitimate issues for policy making, both at the national and international level. The major themes of the International Women's Year and Conference were-- Equality, Development and Peace. Equality, however, had been a dominant issue for the U.N. Commission on the Status of Women and it came primarily from the feminist movement of the Western industrialized nations. Peace was increasingly considered to be a women's issue by the countries of the Eastern block. Development, on the other hand, was a recent issue put forward mainly by the newly independent "Third World" nations as a key to improving women's lives.

During the Decade, the important but previously invisible role of women in the social and economic development of the poorer countries was highlighted. The declaration of the

International Decade for Women (1975-85) signified the new visibility of Women in Development (WID) in international forums.

The WID approach was adopted pointing to the fact that women's contribution for development is not recognized by the policy makers. Women are treated as 'beneficiaries' of development, not as active agents of development. Prior to this, however, women were brought into 'development' policy on very sex-specific terms. Men were seen as the heads of households and productive agents. Women were seen as housewives, mothers and reproducers. Therefore development efforts targeted the male population, while women were relegated to the marginal welfare sector.

In this Unit we will trace the emergence of a gender-sensitive development debate. But before we examine the details of the term 'Women in Development' and the U.N. Women's Conferences, we need to understand the concept of 'development', who defines it and how it is defined within the context of international politics.

6.2 OBJECTIVES

After studying this Unit you should be able to

- highlight the gender blindness of Development and Underdevelopment;
 - discuss the feminist critiques of Development; and
 - analyze the different approaches to WID, WAD and GAD Approaches.
-

6.3 CONCEPTS OF DEVELOPMENT AND UNDERDEVELOPMENT

Till the mid-sixties, modernization theories were used to understand post-colonial societies. Modernization theories perceived development as an evolutionary, unilinear process of change that would change traditional society, through various stages to a state of modernity. It involved a total transformation of traditional societies, their institutions, cultures and behaviour. The crux of these theories was that development involved industrial growth which was autonomous and self-sustaining. This form of development, which had occurred in the west, was assumed to be a role model for the rest of the world to follow. There was a kind of economic determinism involved, as development was measured mainly in terms of growth in GNP and it was believed that the benefits of economic growth would 'trickle down' to households at the bottom of the income hierarchy. On the whole, modernization theories argued that capitalism played a progressive role in the development of traditional and underdeveloped societies.

By the late 1960s and early 1970s there was a growing disillusionment with modernization theories. Its inability to explain the failure of capitalist development in different parts of the world, particularly Latin America, led to the rise of an alternative theory, namely underdevelopment theory or dependency theory. The theorists Andre Gunder Frank and Immanuel Wallerstein have contributed immensely to the development and popularization of dependency theory.

Frank was one of the first theorists to analyze the causes for the underdeveloped and dependent status of the Third World countries. He argues that this is because of the exploitative chain of metropolis-satellite or core-periphery relations that exist throughout the world system that affect both the economy and polity of the peripheral countries.

Through a historical analysis of Chile and Brazil, Frank tries to show the exploitative relation between the capitalist world and the national metropolises to the regional centres and so on to large landholders or merchants who appropriate surplus from small peasants or tenants, and sometimes even from the latter to landless labourers exploited by them in turn. At each point, the international, national and local capitalist system generates economic development for the few and underdevelopment for the many. The entire system has a monopolistic structure which involves the misuse and squandering of resources throughout the system. This capitalist expansion, however, generates the continuous development of the metropolises and the continuous underdevelopment of the satellites. The transfer of surplus from the satellite to the metropolis leads to distorted development in the satellite. Finally it is the imperialist metropolis at the end of the metropolis-satellite chain that appropriates all the resources.

Hence, while there is continuous development of the metropolises, simultaneously there is continuous underdevelopment of the satellites. Highlighting the political consequences of dependency, Frank argues that the ruling classes have a vested interest in maintaining the exploitative and monopolistic capitalist structure that runs like a chain from the villages to the imperialist metropolis. For Frank, therefore, the only way to break out of the monopolistic capitalist system is to have a world-wide socialist revolution. Like Frank, for Wallerstein too, unequal exchange between the core and the periphery leads to the development of the former and underdevelopment of the latter. *The underdevelopment theories, have been completely blind to the question of gender and the contribution of women to economic development. It was at this time that the contribution of Ester Boserup in her book "Women's Role in Economic Development" (1970) was recognized and widely quoted.*

Check Your Progress Exercise 1

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. What do we mean by Underdevelopment?

6.4 BOSERUP'S THESIS

The publication of Ester Boserup's book in 1970, coincided with the growing wave of feminist consciousness in Europe and USA and youth radicalization all over the world. Boserup argues that a change in the density of population results in the change of techniques in farming, which requires a higher labour input resulting in a change in the division of labour between men and women.

She distinguished between two systems of subsistence agriculture. One is characterized by shifting cultivation, done mainly by female farmers, as in Africa. The other, characterized by plough cultivation, done mainly by male farmers as in South Asia. Boserup criticized the "dubious generalization" according to which males were considered to be the providers of food. With her comparative analysis, she pointed out the differences in women's work, emphasizing the important role women played in African agriculture as compared to the lesser role women played in Asian and Latin American countries.

The reasons for such a difference— in Africa were a low density of population, absence of agrarian technologies and shortage of domestic animals for agrarian task. Land was easily accessible and there was less class differentiation. Thus the men were mainly occupied with clearing the land, while the women cultivated subsistence crops.

In her analysis, Boserup points to the existence of a strong correlation between economic conditions and polygamy. In areas of plough cultivation, where there is a small minority of polygamous marriages, the women are totally dependent on their husbands for economic support and they are valued only as mothers.

Boserup went on to analyze and point out the adverse effects that European colonialism and the capitalist penetration of subsistence economies often had on women. The European colonial rulers were largely responsible for the neglect of the female farming systems of Africa and the resulting loss of status of the African women. They were unsympathetic to the female farming systems that they found in many of their colonies and believed in the superiority of the male farming system. Hence, when they introduced modern technology, cash crops, and so forth, Boserup argues that they trained only the males to the neglect of the female farmers. This benefited the men, enhancing their prestige and lowering that of women. The discriminatory policies followed in education and training created a technical, cultural and productivity gap between men and women. Women were increasingly relegated to the subsistence sector of food production using the traditional methods of cultivation. The “land reforms introduced by the European administrators”, also resulted in the loss of land rights for the women. From being cultivators themselves, women were increasingly marginalized from agriculture and reduced to being “unpaid helpers in the production of crops belonging to their husbands”. Thus, women lost income and status in comparison to men.

Boserup also analyzed the status of women and the sexual divisions of labour that existed in non-agricultural activities particularly in the urban areas. She divides towns into predominantly female or male towns. Her thesis challenged the commonly held notion that women's status and their rights automatically improve with modernization. Despite Boserup's path breaking contribution to the field of women in development, her work has also led to a great deal of debate and controversy.

6.4.1 Critique of Boserup

One of the earliest critics of Boserup's thesis, Suellen Huntington, argued that the division of farming systems into male and female, ignored important aspects of male domination which could not be explained only by developments in agricultural technology. Besides this, Huntington pointed out that in female farming systems, women may have had an important role in agricultural production. However, it did not mean that they enjoyed equal status or greater power in relation to men. Claims for women's equality should be argued for on their own merits and not depend on historical evidence that is refutable.

Lourdes Beneria and Gita Sen, argued that Boserup's thesis was "essentially empirical and descriptive" and that it "lacked a clearly defined theoretical framework". They criticized her for accepting the capitalist model of development as given. Women's economic marginalization was due to their incorporation into the worldwide capitalist system which exploited their labour and not because they were excluded from productive labour. Further, they argued that Boserup concentrates on women's role outside the household and thus ignores women's role in reproduction and domestic production. Hence, it is argued that, Boserup's analysis lacks a feminist perspective on women's subordination (For a detailed critique of Boserup's thesis, see L. Beneria and G. Sen, 1981). Boserup's thesis, however, justified the efforts to influence government policy and development on the basis of both

justice and efficiency. The debate on Boserup's thesis can be located in a larger debate which can be largely labeled as the "Decolonization of the Mind" or in other words the issue of development and the politics of knowledge. For the modernization theorists, decolonization had come to mean westernization and the very idea of decolonization assumed a model similar to the child development model. While Carol Gilligan pointed out to the implicit male bias in the model, Nandy had pointed out the implicit imperialistic bias in these models of decolonization. Debates on the western model as environmentally destructive and spiritually lacking were in focus. Tariq Banuri has summarized this in his work "Modernization and its Discontents – A Cultural Perspective on the Theories of Development".

Tariq Banuri points out, that in order to understand the problems of development and progress one needs to look at the cultural context within which they arose. He argues that the theories of modernization are placed in a unique kind of culture, where "the impersonal is superior to the personal". The modernization theories argue that due to this existence of personal relations in traditional societies, development is impeded. The neo-classical economic theory too, Banuri argues, looks upon the individual as separate from the environment.

Banuri suggests that many of the problems in society that seem insoluble, are "based in the assumption of a dichotomy and a hierarchy between the impersonal and the personal spheres of culture". The solution for it is to supplant the idea of hierarchy with that of a 'tension' or 'dialectic' between the two. What is needed is a change in the basic assumption of economic theory that all actions can be reduced to the impersonal sphere and to see human actions as a result of the tension between conflicting obligations and commitments.

The search for an alternative vision thus, begins with the idea of “progress as being the expansion of the awareness of oppression in society”. The existence of a positive relation between impersonality and progress, as claimed by modernization theorists is disqualified. The debate on the meaning of development, it is argued, is highly technocratized and therefore it should be replaced with a ‘broader social definition’. The oppressed on realization of their oppression, will outline their own priorities and take the required social and political action. The social scientist should take responsibility for the long term consequences of their prescription. The indigenous ways of knowing, based on direct personal relationships, should be strengthened. Decentralization is needed in the polity, economy and society. Finally, however, this alternate vision must differ from place to place according to the cultural characteristics of the place.

However, even in these debates on alternative models, gender is not accorded the status of a structural component. The fact that women had not benefited from the new productive opportunities, new technology and market forces, resulted in doubts over the presumed neutrality of the development agencies. This led to the emergence of the WID critique of development. The WID scholars, however, retained the fundamental premise of the liberal world view. The problem was how to integrate women into development.

Check Your Progress Exercise 2

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. Whose writings highlighted women’s contribution to economic development?

6.5 EMERGENCE OF WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT (WID) APPROACH

6.5.1 Welfare Approach

Initially, during the First Development Decade 1961-70, there was no mention of women specifically. WID was characterized by the **Welfare approach**. It was assumed that social and economic development in general, would bring about the desired changes for women. Women were seen as passive beneficiaries of development with focus on their reproductive role. However, at this early stage, the emphasis was on equal rights for women rather than on economic development.

6.5.2 Equity approach

During the Second Development Decade, 1971-80, the importance of the “full integration of women in the total development efforts,” was emphasized. The **Equity approach** aimed at gaining equity for women in the development process. Women were seen as active participants in development. The main goal was to integrate women into the development process more productively. The key route through this could be achieved which was equality of opportunity through education and training. A number of committees within professional associations, new women’s groups and others were formed. They came together on important issues like equal pay for equal work, greater visibility of women within professional organizations, equal rights amendment, and so on. This led to the formation of many women’s pressure groups especially the ones concerning Women in Development (WID). The advocates of WID pointed out to the phenomena that many scholars had

observed, particularly in the developing countries i.e. the adverse impact that development seemed to have on women. The feminization of poverty and the growing number of women-headed households as a result of the development policies was also highlighted.

With pressure from the American women's movement, the United Nations declared 1975 as the International Women's Year and 1975-1985 as the International Women's Decade. With this there was a growing awareness of women's issues and an acceptance of their demands as legitimate issues for policy making, both at the national and international level. The major themes of the Decade were – Equality, Development and Peace. The UN Decade for Women and the international conferences gave impetus to the gender component in development debates.

Check Your Progress Exercise 3

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. Trace the emergence of the WID approach.

6.6 THREE WORLD CONFERENCES ON WOMEN

In 1975, the World Conference for the International Women's Year was held in Mexico City. The Conference highlighted the differences in the needs of women from the

Western industrialized nations and those from the agricultural nations. This frequently led to debates on what embodied “women’s issues”. The equity approach was identified as ‘developmental’, but mainly reflected “First world” feminist pre-occupations with equality. The “Second world” delegates were concerned with peace. They argued that capitalism and militarism was responsible for women’s problems. The “Third World” delegates were concerned with development. They argued that development was the key to improving women’s lives. While the women from the underdeveloped nations were concerned mainly with the survival of the family unit, employment opportunities and legal and economic roles of women; those from the developed nations emphasized the symbolic expressions of authority, status, and control over one’s own body, discrimination against women, etc. It also meant the adoption of different strategies for change in the status of women.

Scholars like Ester Boserup, Elise Boulding and others, have noted that often, economic development in the underdeveloped countries leads to structural changes that dislocate women from income generating occupations, or place a greater load on women who continue with subsistence agriculture, while men move into mechanized agriculture, grow cash crops or migrate to the cities. It was also pointed out that there are a growing number of female headed-households. It was recommended that these women should also be given priority for employment on par with men with family responsibilities. Stress was also laid on the fact that peace also could be achieved only by realizing that women, who consisted of half the world’s population, were also human beings with equal rights in civil, political, economic and social fields.

6.6.1 Anti- Poverty Approach

The Equity approach, however, was considered threatening and not popular with governments. It was criticized as Western feminism. Hence there was a shift to the **Anti-**

Poverty approach. This approach toned down equality because of criticism. It was more concerned with redistribution along with growth and basic needs. Its purpose was to ensure poor women increase their productivity, since women's poverty was seen as a problem of underdevelopment not their subordination. However this approach isolated poor women as a separate category with a tendency to recognize only their productive role. It was more popular among the NGOs and developed at a small scale.

6.6.2 Efficiency Approach

With the UN Mid-decade Conference on Women held at Copenhagen in 1980, the concept of WID had shifted from the equity to **efficiency approach** and was articulated in economic terms. The conference was dominated by debates on trade, development and politics. There were heated debates over the Palestinian issue, the effects of apartheid on women in South Africa, of women refugees all over the world. Despite the highly publicized arguments, women from different parts of the world endeavoured to understand one another and create a more congruent perspective. At this conference it was recognized that women were both participants and victims in political struggles.

Irene Tinker in her review of the Copenhagen conference asked -- "How do you take one tune and encourage variation while eliciting orchestral support?" The response and comments to it by a number of scholars showed that many people were looking at various women's issues that had not been mentioned, recognized or clarified before the decade began. One of the main functions of the Mexico City and Copenhagen conference was consciousness raising.

The emergence of the efficiency approach in this period should be seen in the context of a declining world economy and accompanying stabilization and adjustment policies. With serious cuts in welfare spending, the focus on efficient development meant that women

became crucial actors in the development scenario. It recognized women's resilience and ability to adjust to crisis. In the formal sector women are prepared to work for longer hours for less pay, they are usually hired later and fired earlier. Given these disadvantages in the formal sector, women are willing to accept worse conditions than men in the informal sector. All these qualities attracted development planners to focus their programmes on women.

These approaches recognize that women play a significant economic role both within and outside the families. The efficiency approach focused on credit for women, supplementary income generating projects for women, micro-enterprise for women and so on. It focused only on economic aspects of women in development and it was designed to suit the interests of bigger agents of development rather than the women themselves. This approach is still the most popular WID approach for many national governments, state machineries for women and aid agencies, as well as NGOs who are keen to maintain the status quo in the name of economic development without having to question the underlying power relations in the communities in which they work.

At the third and final conference of the international decade for women at Nairobi, the various dimensions of women's needs came up. It was at this conference that the needs of the "Third World" women gained recognition and were highlighted. The main concerns of women living in subsistence societies were environmental issues, methods in forest and water management, sustainable agriculture, etc. These issues were combined with environmental issues on a world scale. The demands of "Third World" countries for techniques to limit the drudgery of everyday work were also put forward. Divisive and political issues such as the debt crises and its effects on countries of the "Third World", the issue of apartheid in South Africa were debated upon. There was growing recognition of the fact that one-third of the families of the world were headed by women. The women worked to support their families and were also charged with bringing up the children.

Check Your Progress Exercise 4

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. List the first three international women's conferences.

6.7 WOMEN AND DEVELOPMENT (WAD) APPROACH

The Women and Development (WAD) approach pointed out that women are already integrated into the development process in an exploitative way. This is due to the fact that planners hold imprecise assumptions about women's specific activities leading to the neglect of women's real needs and over-exploitation of their labour.

Proponents of the WAD approach are mainly activists and theorists from the South and few from the North who saw the limitations of WID and argued that women would never get their equal share of development benefits unless patriarchy and global inequality are addressed.

Women from the developed nations were slowly realizing that the concerns of "Third World" women were also legitimate. They began to identify with them and their earlier patronizing attitude towards "Third World" women diminished. Efforts were made to link issues of the family with that of politics at the local, national and international levels. The Third World feminist movement increasingly incorporated struggles against sexual inequality

with political struggles. The gathering at Nairobi provided women of the “Third World” as well as the “First World” the chance to combine forces to fight against injustice.

The WAD approach provides a more critical view of women’s position than WID. It is assumed that women’s position will improve once international structures become more equitable. However how these could change is not clearly explained. According to this perspective, women were not a neglected resource but overburdened and undervalued. Their substantial contribution to development needs to be recognized, along with a redistribution of its benefits and burdens between men and women. The WAD approach also demanded “affirmative action” by the State as “Laissez Faire” in the market worsened already existing inequalities.

6.7.1 Empowerment approach

In this period, the **Empowerment approach** was adopted. Unlike the previous approaches, the empowerment approach is a direct result of “Third World” women’s social and grassroots movements and their realities and experiences of mainstream ‘development’. Its roots were in Latin American social movements where educationists such as Paulo Freire and Evan Ilich used conscientization as a tool of mobilizing oppressed sections.

The approach emerged out of a critique of all other approaches, which were based on the expert analysis of how and what “Third World” women need to develop themselves and their communities. This approach gained momentum in the 1980s and continues to be popular among social activists, feminist researchers, NGOs and Aid agencies who are genuinely interested in the transformatory potential of development initiatives.

The empowerment approach questions the notion that 'women' can be addressed as a universal category. Further, for the first time women's subordination was seen as a men's problem as well.

The empowerment approach broadened the scope of development theory by addressing issues hitherto not considered relevant. These included oppressive gender relations, ecological destruction, and the ethics of multinational control over the developing countries and so on. Thus the empowerment approach became most threatening to government and international agencies. The Self-Employed Women's Organization (SEWA) started in Ahmedabad, India; the Grameen Bank (Bangladesh), are examples of the success of the strategy of empowerment through organization.

At the Nairobi conference, 1985 some Third World Women formed a group DAWN (Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era) which interpreted development issues from the woman's perspective. They pointed out that the concept of development followed in the post-colonial world has been guided by a western patriarchal and capitalist idea of economic development which believed that change is linear. They rejected the aggressiveness of the dominant system and advocated the values of nurturance and openness, discarded hierarchy and recognized the diverse but equally genuine meanings of feminism of every area.

The UN decade for women brought to light the fact that women still perform two-thirds of the world's work, but earn one tenth of its income and own only one hundredth of its property. There was recognition of the fact that the 'feminization of poverty was on the increase'. Women's participation in the goals and strategies for change and their empowerment, both within and outside the home, were stressed if change was to occur.

The conferences of the International Decade for Women brought about greater interaction and mobilization of women from various countries. They provided the motive to investigate the common concerns of women worldwide. Conventional indicators of development-modernization, urbanization, per capita income, growth of the economy, mechanization, white-green-blue revolution were questioned. During the conferences, the various meanings of the term 'women in development' predominated. Besides economic development, it also signified 'legal equality, education, health, employment and empowerment'.

Equal rights for women and men before law were stressed in the early years. During the International Women's Decade a number of conventions were passed, important among them is the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). Later on, legal rights were not given great importance. Though most countries had granted women's equality, they were not enforced.

It was argued that women's status could be improved by educating them. However, the earlier literacy programme had failed because classes were held at the time when the women were busy with economic activities. No formal education systems were advocated and emphasis was laid on reducing gender biases within the education system.

Emphasis was laid on employing women especially in the development agencies as an effective method of ensuring that development programme reach and involve women. Consciousness raising and empowerment of women was emphasized.

Economic development remained the main focus of 'women in development'. The attempt was to remove the gender bias in development planning that over-looked women's role in economic activities.

6.7.2 The Indian Context

The U.N. decade for women generated a lot of data on the status of women the world over. In India, political emergency was declared in 1975. Yet in this period, the UN sponsored International Women's Decade provided the space for women's organizations to meet and discuss issues, organize seminars and so on.

It was during this period that an important and significant report on the status of women in India was published entitled the 'Towards Equality' Report (in 1974 it was tabled in the parliament). The Committee on the Status of Women was appointed by the Government of India in 1971 to look into the changes – legal, constitutional, administrative, political, social and economic, -- that had occurred in the status of women since Independence. The Committee submitted its report in December 1974. Its investigations revealed the dismal reality of declining sex ratios, decreasing participation of women in employment and political activities. Illiteracy and lack of vocational training prevented women from being absorbed into the modern economy. Development itself was very uneven between different regions, communities and sections of society.

The low status of women in society was indicated by a number of factors such as – the age of marriage of girls was below 15 years in more than 1/3 of the districts of India. The life expectation for females was 45 years as compared to 47 years for males in 1961-71. The gap in male and female life expectation was in fact increasing. The female mortality rate was much higher than that of males especially in the age group of 15-44 years. Though there has been an increase in the female population, the number of females per thousand males has been declining. In 1901, it was 972 females per thousand males, but by 1971, it had declined to 930 females per thousand males and in 1991 it had declined further to 929 women per thousand males. One of the reasons for the low sex ratio, it is observed, is the high maternal

mortality. In 1964, it was 252 per 1,00,000 live births in the whole country, and in 1968, it went up to 573 for 1,00,000 live births in rural areas. Maternal mortality has been mainly due to frequent pregnancies, abortions, malnutrition, etc. another reason is rampant female feicide and infanticide.

The literacy rate among women was much lower than for males – 18.4% and 39.5% respectively. The number of women in the labour force came down from 34.4% in 1911 to 17.35% in 1971. 94% of the women workers are found in the unorganized sector and the rest 6% in the organized sector. It was also noted that a majority of women did not make use of the rights and opportunities guaranteed by the Constitution. There has been an increase in the incidence of dowry in the urban as well as rural areas and also among communities which did not follow this practice earlier.

This report demystified the popular belief that equality between the sexes had been guaranteed by the Constitution. The mid-sixties witnessed an economic crisis, stagnation, inflation and increasing lawlessness. There was general discontentment and displeasure in society, especially among the youth and working class. All over the world there were strong protests by students, trade unions and anti-price rise movements as well as anti-war and colonial liberation movements.

In India too, in the seventies, there were student protests, anti-price rise *morchas*, tribal revolts, and the Naxalbari movement. Women participated in large numbers in these movements. A number of radical activists started autonomous groups involved with education, popular science (KSSP – Kerala Shastra Sahitya Parishad), health, environmental protection, civil liberties, women's issues, tribal issues. Involvement with the anti-price rise protests, student and tribal movements, made the women realize the importance of taking up issues related to the oppression of women, violence in the family, dowry, alcoholism, sexual

discrimination against women. It was in the decade of the 1970s that the “Third World” began to emerge as a challenge and a force to reckon with. This heralded the critiques of ‘development’ and ‘under-development’ in the “Third World” countries from both feminist and others.

Check Your Progress Exercise 5

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. Is the Empowerment approach drawn from WAD?

6.8 CRITIQUE OF WID

The main critique of Women in Development came ‘from three sources: - Marxist feminists, women from the developing countries and scholars who sympathized with the female sphere approach’. In their effort to influence the development experts, the advocate practitioners and scholars of the WID approach did not ‘raise basic theoretical issues’, but instead, sought to adjust the contemporary ‘development practices to include and benefit

women'. As the field developed, the pragmatic approach of the WID practitioners and advocates and the detail of women's lives coming from WID scholars began to influence the theorists. The theorists then raised questions about the global power structures, values etc. which were more relevant.

The Marxist feminists have questioned the constitution of women as a 'category'. They argue that biological sex has been misunderstood as gender relations through social, cultural, political and economic forces. However, women's interests vary by class. But one common factor, among women of all classes and in all societies, is their subordinate position in society. The main cause of this is class and patriarchy. While Marxists and other feminists would try to change this situation and fight for equality, the feminists who argue for a female sphere, would emphasise the difference. Over the years, other factors of subordination of women have come up like race in the USA, colonialism, underdevelopment and dependency in the "Third World" and the intricacies of caste, religion and ethnicity in India.

Development programmes that are supposed to help women with their practical and material problems and to address the causes of their subordination often end up perpetuating it. What is required, therefore, is feminism that provides a political basis for bringing women of all classes together despite their differences.

Throughout the Decade, the effort was to associate value and status to women's work. But often, the emphasis has been on economic activities. Though women have worked for long hours, be it in subsistence societies or the new industries of developing societies, their work has not been valued and they have not got high status. The effort now is to decrease the woman's work and simultaneously empower her. This would need an examination of the controls on woman's labour and hence an examination of the household and the issue of patriarchy.

The female sphere theorists argue that the demand for equality of work for a just and egalitarian society may be disadvantageous for women. In a society where women enjoyed autonomy in the private sphere, for the sake of family however, they are withdrawn from the visible public labour force and are made economically dependent. However, many women have chosen to retain their economic independence.

Yet another perspective is put forward by scholars like Elise Boulding, who argue that women have developed the quality of nurturing, survival and peace. It is these feminine values that will save the earth and not the male values of ruling and conquering. The need is for environment-friendly technology and efforts towards peace.

The DAWN report points out the connection between global economic policies and women at the local, national and international levels. The economic crises, ecological degradation, increasing militarism and so on are all linked to the global policies. Scholars have pointed out how the debt crises, the structural adjustment policies and the macro-level development policies have had differential effects on male and female work, and how they perpetuate gender bias in market policies. Rae Blumberg argues that the African food crisis was the result of macro-level development policies that overlooked the importance of women's contribution to economic development.

Kathryn Ward, in her work 'Women in the Global Economy', argues that women's economic status has stagnated due to underdevelopment processes. Increasingly, women are pushed into subsistence agriculture or the service or informal sectors. Until the coming of transnational corporations, women did not get industrial employment. However, even this employment is not permanent and they are once again displaced into the service sectors.

Ward argues that women's status has been structured both directly and indirectly by the global capitalist system. She highlights three processes of trade dependency, dependent

development, and debt dependency as being particularly important in shaping women's status. As a result of this global capitalist system, the peripheral regions within this system experience socio-economic dependence on the core nations along with underdevelopment.

The major problems with the WID approach are as follows.

- WID considers women as a homogeneous group. It ignores the fact that women are not a single uniform category. Women are differentiated by racial, economic and other factors which are not considered important.
- WID projects the myth that women's development can be achieved by addressing economic issues alone. Yet in a context where women are not allowed to own property and do not have control over resources, it is questionable how income generating projects can lead to women's development.
- It does not question the kind of development that is being imposed on the developing countries. WID does not have any scope for change and transformation. It does not challenge existing power relations in society.

Hence it has remained popular.

However, since the early 1980s WID came under severe attack, mainly from "Third World" women's movements, who are questioning the relevance of such development programmes in the context of continuing poverty and oppression. This has led to a rethinking of the WID approach and resulted in the emergence of the **Gender and Development approach** or GAD.

6.9 GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT (GAD) APPROACH

GAD, which shares elements with the empowerment approach, gained popularity in the 1980s and attempts to address the loopholes of WID. It is rooted in post-development theory and post-structuralist critiques in feminism.

GAD does not consider women as a uniform group. It maintains that women's situation should be seen in the context of the socio-economic, racial and other factors that shape a particular society. It points to the importance of understanding the relationship between women and men and how society influences their respective roles. Development to be meaningful will have to take all these factors into consideration.

This approach rejects the dichotomy between the public and the private. It focuses attention on the oppression of women in the family, within the private sphere of the household. It emphasizes the state's role in providing social services to promote women's emancipation. Women are seen as agents of change rather than passive recipients of development.

The focus is on strengthening women's legal rights. It also talks in terms of upsetting the existing power relations in society. Gender is an issue that cuts across all economic, social and political processes. The GAD approach attempts to identify both the practical gender needs of women as well as the strategic gender needs that are closely related.

The problem with GAD is that it is easy in the name of gender, to disguise and even side track real issues that affect women. Gender can rise above the personal, which means the personal can remain behind the scene, despite all the efforts that go into the analysis of 'social construction of gender'.

Most often, however, GAD is seen as just a new label for the same old women's programmes which do not address power relations in society or women's oppression. Though

it is popular among funding agencies and NGOs and has the potential to be different, it has become institutionalized like WID.

Check Your Progress Exercise 6

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. What is GAD?

2. How is GAD different from other approaches?

6.10 FOURTH WORLD CONFERENCE ON WOMEN

At the Fourth World Conference on Women held in Beijing in December 1995, the mood was sombre, reflecting the turmoil of the past decade - - the global economic crises, the collapse of most communist regimes, unmitigated ethnic conflict and growing conservatism. This is reflected in the disproportionate burden borne by women. Statistics showed that

women today constitute 70% of the world's 1.3 billion poor, 2/3rd of the illiterates and (with their children) 80% of the 25 million refugees mostly victims of armed conflict.

The single most critical issue at the conference was women's experience of the economic crises: Southern women reeling under structural adjustment; East European women faced with rising unemployment and collapse of state-provided welfare services, and Western women faced with sharp cuts in public expenditure on health, education and welfare.

The important outcome at Beijing was the new recognition by both NGOs and governments that macro-economic policy is also an issue of critical importance for women and therefore a feminist concern. Furthermore, it was important not just to be reactive after policies have done their damage, but to be creative in framing alternatives. The 'Beijing Platform for Action' recognizes the link between the economic and the political. Eradication of poverty cannot be accomplished through anti-poverty programmes alone, but will require democratic participation and changes in economic structures to ensure access for all women to resources, opportunities and public services.

Check Your Progress Exercise 7

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. Where was the Fourth World Conference on Women held?

2. What are the key issue discussed at the conference?

6.11 SUMMING UP

In conclusion, the significant issues that emerge are: In the 60's and 70's women voiced their dissent and protest through the mass movements as well as autonomous feminist groups.

The 'Western' model of development as the role-model was not only questioned but women activists in the Third World refused the label of "always and already victims" that the Western feminists had accorded them. This translated into viewing women, not as passive recipients of development but as active agents in the process.

The issues of gender, nationality and ethnicity within the context of the global political economy came into focus; rightly questioning thereby the 'woman' as subject of feminist debates.

The increasing marginalization of women in the economy, their increasing landlessness and lack of access to resources had resulted in feminization of poverty. A significant relationship between the feminization of poverty and female-headed households was brought into focus.

6.12 GLOSSARY

Economic Development: The progress of the economy in means of quality and quantity is known as economic development. It also means the development and adoption of new technologies, transition from agricultural economy to industrial economy and improvement in the standard of living of people.

Marginalization: Marginalization is a social process which pushes some sections of the population outside the mainstream or being made to be at the margins of society. They are excluded or ignored in the mainstream development process.

Laissez Faire: It is policy or practice of Government letting people act without interference or direction of government to have their industry, business etc. which lead to economic growth. There would not be any conditions imposed by government and no regulation and control.

Decolonization: Decolonization is being free from the colonial status. It is getting independence status from the country which has control over them and treats them as their colony.

GNP: GNP means Gross National Product. It is the total value of final goods and services produced within a country in a particular year by its citizens. It is one of the measures of economic conditions in the country.

6.13 ANSWERS TO CHECK YOUR PROGRESS EXERCISES

Check Your Progress Exercise 1:

1. Lack of economic growth is considered as under development. This is measured in terms of GDP.

Check Your Progress Exercise 2:

1. Esther Boserup

Check Your Progress Exercise 3:

1. The pressure from the Third World women group led to the emergence of WID approach. In this approach the status of women on par with men was discussed in terms of equality. This was emerged in the year 1975.

Check Your Progress Exercise 4:

1. Mexico – 1975
2. Nairobi – 1980
3. Copenhagen – 1985

Check Your Progress Exercise 5:

1. Yes, in WAD period, the **Empowerment approach** was adopted. Unlike the previous approaches, the empowerment approach is a direct result of “Third World” women’s social and grassroots movements and their realities and experiences of mainstream ‘development’. Its roots were in Latin American social movements where educationists such as Paulo Frire and Evan Ilich used conseintization as a tool of mobilizing oppressed sections.

Check Your Progress Exercise 6:

1. GAD means Gender and Development.
2. GAD doesn’t consider women as a uniform group.

Check Your Progress Exercise 7:

1. Beijing - 1995
2. Representation of women in social, political and economic institutions.

6.14 REFERENCES

Banuri, T., "Modernization and its discontents: A critical perspective on theories of Development", In F.A. Marglin and S.A. Marglin, ed., *Dominating Knowledge: Development, Culture and Resistance*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990.

Beneria, L. and G. Sen, "Accumulation, Reproduction, and Women's Role in Economic Development: Boserup Revisited", *SIGNS*, Winter, vol. 7(2), pp. 279-298, 1981.

Blumberg, R.L., "Towards a Feminist Theory of Development", In R.A. Wallace, eds., *Feminism and Sociological Theory*, Newbury Park, CA: Sage publications, 1989.

Boserup, E., *Women's Role in Economic Development*, London: Allen and Unwin, 1970.

Gaidzanwa, R., J.F. O'Barr, I. Tinker et al., "Reflections on forum' 85 in Nairobi, Kenya: Voices from the International Women's Studies Community", *SIGNS*. Spring. 11(3), pp. 584-606, 1986.

Gilligan, C., *In a Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development*, Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982.

Huntington, S., "Issues in Women's Role in Economic Development: Critique and Alternatives", *Journal of Marriage and the Family*. 37(4), pp. 1001-12, 1975.

Kabir, N., *Reversed Realities- Gender Hierarchies in Development Thought*, New Delhi: Kali for Women, 1996.

Larrain, J., *Theories of Development: Capitalism, Colonialism and Dependency*, London: Polity Press, 1989.

Marglin, F.A. and S.A. Marglin, ed., *Dominating Knowledge: Development, Culture and Resistance*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990.

Mohanty, C.T., "Through Western Eyes", *Boundary*, No. XVII (Reprinted by Vikas Adhyayan Kendra), 1992.

Moser, C.O.N., *Gender Planning and Development- Theory, Practice and Training*, New York: Routledge, 1993.

Nandy, A., *Science, Hegemony and Violence: A Requiem for Modernity*, Oxford: University Press, 1989.

Report of the Committee on the Status of Women in India, Towards Equality, 1974, Delhi: Government of India, 1975.

Sen, G. and C. Grown., *Development Crises and Alternative visions: Third World Women's Perspectives*. 2nd edition. New York: Monthly Review Press, 1987. (Written for the project Development Alternatives for Women in a New Era: DAWN. First edition without author's names published by DAWN 1985).

SIGNS, 1975 *Report of the World Conference of the U.N. Decade for Women – Equality, Development and Peace*. Copenhagen. 1980. U.N. Publication, A/CONF. 94/35.

Report of the World Conference of the International Women's Year. Mexico City. 1975. New York: U.N. Publication, E/CONF. 66/34.

Report of the World Conference to Review and Appraise the Achievements of the U.N. Decade for Women: Equality, Development and Peace. Nairobi, Kenya. 1985. U.N. Publication, A/CONF. 116/28.

Tinker, I. , *Persistent Inequalities- Women and World Development*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1990.

Ward, K., “Women in the Global Economy”, In Gutek, Strombek and Larwood, ed., *Women and Work: An Annual Review*, London: Sage Publications, 1988.

6.15 QUESTIONS FOR REFLECTION AND PRACTICE

1. Elaborate Boserup’s contribution to visibility of women and development.
2. Describe the emergence of the WID approach.
3. Trace the WID approach through the first three world conferences.
4. Elaborate the GAD approach

UNIT 7: WID, WAD, GAD Part-II

Structure

7.1 Introduction

7.2 Objectives

7.3 Empowerment

7.3.1 Economic Empowerment

7.3.2 Economic Empowerment Through Credit Programmes

7.3.3 Empowerment Through Political Participation

7.3.4 Empowerment as a process

7.3.5 Implications for Policies and Strategies

7.4 Gender Mainstreaming

7.5 Gender Planning

7.6 Gender Budgeting

7.7 Gender Auditing

7.8 Summing Up

7.9 Glossary

7.10 Answers to Check Your Progress Exercises

7.11 References

7.12 Questions for Reflection and Practice

7.1 INTRODUCTION

For the past three decades international organizations and national governments have focused on gender equality. The last two UN conferences on women analyzed the state of gender equality and the impact of public policy and action. They developed the prospective of gender equality as a human right and social justice among nation states. With the efforts of bodies like UN Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), Beijing Platform for Action was developed. In spite of more achievements based on WID, WAD and GID perspectives more efforts are needed to achieve improvements in overall well-being of women and reduce the gender gap. In order to accelerate development intervention and to address challenges to engender all development issues, new perspectives have to be developed. Through the analysis of developments of the past, new approaches have emerged. Based on the approach many tools were developed. This Unit will deal with the tools and country specific examples.

7.2 OBJECTIVES

After studying this Unit, you should be able to

- explain the GAD approach;
- discuss the tools of Gender and Development; and
- describe the applications of GAD tools in programmes and policy making.

7.3 EMPOWERMENT

According to Zoë Oxaal and Sally Baden regarding *Gender and Empowerment: Definitions, approaches and implications for policy* (Sussex: IDS, BRIDGE, October, 1997)

Empowerment is a process whereby women critically reflect on the condition of their own lives and acquire the knowledge skills and consciousness to change or transform that condition. It is a condition where women's self reliance and inner strength are enhanced and thereby gain they control over assets and resources and subsequently are able to control all aspects of their lives. This empowerment can be reflected in four ways namely, economic, political, social and cultural.

The word 'empowerment' is used in many different contexts and by many different organizations. For example, literature about 'empowerment' is found in the fields of education, social work, psychology, in US radical politics in the 1960s and community development groups in the North and South, as well as in the work of feminist and development organizations.

The idea of 'power' is at the root of the term empowerment. Power can be understood as operating in a number of different ways:

- *power over:* This power involves an either/or relationship of domination/subordination. Ultimately, it is based on socially sanctioned threats of violence and intimidation, it requires constant vigilance to maintain, and it invites active and passive resistance;
- *power to:* This power relates to having decision-making authority, power to solve problems and can be creative and enabling;
- *power with:* This power involves people organising with a common purpose or common understanding to achieve collective goals;
- *power within:* This power refers to self confidence, self awareness and assertiveness. It relates to how individuals can recognize through analyzing their

experience how power operates in their lives, and gain the confidence to act to influence and change this. (Williams *et al*, 1994).

Box 1: Perspectives on empowerment

The Human Development Report 1995, stresses that empowerment is about participation:

Empowerment. Development must be *by* people, not only *for* them. People must participate fully in the decisions and processes that shape their lives (UN, 1995). At the same time this promotes a rather instrumentalist view of empowerment; Investing in women's capabilities and empowering them to exercise their choices is not only valuable in itself but is also the surest way to contribute to economic growth and overall development (UN, 1995)

For Oxfam, empowerment is about challenging oppression and inequality:

Empowerment involves challenging the forms of oppression which compel millions of people to play a part in their society on terms which are inequitable, or in ways which deny their human rights (Oxfam, 1995).

Feminist activists stress that women's empowerment is not about replacing one form of empowerment with another: Women's empowerment should lead to the liberation of men from false value systems and ideologies of oppression. It should lead to a situation where each one can become a whole being regardless of gender, and use their fullest potential to construct a more humane society for all (Akhtar 1992 quoted in Batliwala 1994: 131).

Jo Rowlands points out that empowerment is a bottom-up process and cannot be bestowed from the top down: The outside professional cannot expect to control the outcomes of authentic empowerment being given by one group to another hides an attempt to keep control. (Rowlands, 1995)

UNIFEM

UNIFEM includes the following factors in its definition of women's empowerment:

- acquiring understanding of gender relations and the ways in which these relations can be changed.
- Developing a sense of self-worth, a belief in one's ability to secure desired changes and the right to control one's own life.
- Gaining the ability to generate choices and exercise bargaining power.
- Developing the ability to organize and influence the direction of social change to create a more just social and economic order, nationally and internationally.

The current popularity of the term empowerment in development coincides with recent questioning of the efficacy of central planning and the role of 'the state', and moves by donor governments and multilateral funding agencies to embrace NGOs as partners in development. Political and institutional problems have gained prominence on the development agenda with a focus on human rights, good governance and participation.

Recent UN conferences have advocated that women's empowerment is central to development. The United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) Agenda 21 mentions women's advancement and empowerment in decision-making, including women's participation in 'national and international ecosystem management and control of environment degradation' as a key area for sustainable development. The International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD) in Cairo, discussed the population issue not just as a technical, demographic problem, but as a choice that women should be empowered to take within the context of their health and reproductive rights. The

Copenhagen Declaration of the World Summit on Social Development (WSSD), called for the recognition that empowering people, particularly women, to strengthen their own capacities is a major objective of development, and that empowerment requires the full participation of people in the formulation, implementation and evaluation of decisions determining the functioning and well-being of societies. The Report of the UN Fourth World Conference on Women called its Platform for Action ‘an agenda for women’s empowerment’ meaning that ‘the principle of shared power and responsibility should be established between women and men at home, in the workplace and in the wider national and international communities’.

Box 2: Empowerment as a feminist vision of development

Development Alternatives for Women in New Era (DAWN) is a network of Southern activists, researchers and policymakers, which is closely associated with the development of ideas about women’s empowerment. Founded in the mid-1980s, DAWN has questioned the impact of development on the poor, especially women, and advocated the need for alternative development processes that would give primary emphasis to the basic needs and survival of the majority of the world’s people. DAWN has sought to link micro-level activities from the experience of grassroots initiatives at community level, to a macro-level perspective. They challenge the assumption behind many projects and programmes targeting women, that the main problem for Third World women is insufficient participation in an otherwise benevolent process of growth and development. DAWN argue the need for a new vision of development based on the perspective of poor Third World women. This perspective focuses attention on the related problems of poverty and inequality and the critical dimensions of resource use and abuse.

1. Check Your Progress Exercise 1:

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. Define empowerment.

2. Expand ICPD and UNCED.

7.3.1 Economic Empowerment

Empowerment is often envisaged as individual rather than as collective, and focused on entrepreneurship and individual self-reliance, rather than on co-operation to challenge power structures which subordinate women (or other marginalized groups). This individualistic approach to empowerment fits together with the belief in entrepreneurial capitalism and market forces as the main saviours of sickly or backward economies, and with the current trend for limiting state provision of welfare, services and employment . It is also consonant with a liberal approach to democracy, emphasizing individual rights and participation in decision-making, through the electoral process.

7.3.2 Economic Empowerment through Credit Programmes

Microcredit programmes, many targeting women and claiming to empower them, have become extremely popular among donors and NGOs in recent years. The change in development policies from the focus on women's active role in production as a means to more efficient development, to the approach of women's empowerment through women organizing for greater self-reliance, has also meant a change in policies for the enhancement of women's economic role. The focus has changed from providing grants to financial assistance to women through the establishment of special credit schemes. Credit schemes are seen as having the potential to link women with the formal banking sector and thereby integrating women in mainstream development. Many credit schemes aimed at women attempt to follow the model of well-known micro-credit providers such as the Grameen Bank. The problems of high administration costs and lack of collateral of small-scale women borrowers are overcome by establishing borrower solidarity groups based on joint liability.

The ability of credit schemes to promote women's empowerment has come under close scrutiny. Research on credit programmes has shown that apparently successful credit programmes targeting credit to women cannot be taken at face value without a more careful examination of the social context in which women live.

Box 3: Credit for Women in Rural Bangladesh

A study of rural credit programmes in Bangladesh highlighted the problems of ascertaining who actually had control over credit, as research showed that a significant proportion of women's loans were in fact controlled by male relatives. High repayment rates of loans by women cannot be taken as clear evidence that women have made effective loan investments, or that they have been empowered through the loan. Where men take control of loans and invest them badly, women's position may even be worsened, as women may be forced to

mobilise repayment funds from resources which would otherwise be used for consumption or savings. The control of loans and repayment are also potential sources of gender-related tension within rural households . Improving women's access to credit is a positive step, but is by no means enough to secure their 'economic empowerment'.

7.3.3 Empowerment through Political Participation

One important approach to supporting women's empowerment is the promotion of the participation of women in formal politics, alongside support to broad programmes of democratization and good governance with a strong focus on developing civil society. This includes promoting women in government and national and local party politics as well as supporting women's involvement in NGOs and women's movements. In 1994, only 5.7 per cent of the world's cabinet ministers were women . In government, women in decision-making positions tend to be concentrated in social, law and justice ministries. Fewer women are to be found in chief executive and economic areas. This poor representation is in spite of the fact that women are found in large numbers in lower-level positions in public administration, political parties, trade unions and business, who could potentially serve as representatives at higher levels .

There are a range of possible mechanisms to increase women's participation in political life which have had varying degrees of success including:

- reform of political parties, quotas and other forms of affirmative action;
- training to develop women's skills and gender sensitivity;
- work with women's sections of political parties; and
- development of women's political organizations.

Quotas have been used to increase women's participation in the leadership of political parties and in party lists for elections. They may be one of the only ways to ensure some representation of women in countries where this is very low, and they can be effective where women already have some degree of political power, such as in the Nordic countries or South Africa. For example the Norwegian Labour Party stipulates that at least 40 percent of candidates for election must be women. In Norway, quotas proved an effective way of increasing the number of women in parliament. In order that women's perspectives are placed on the political agenda a critical mass of women is required, with 30 per cent often cited as a figure above which women begin to make an impact on political life.

However, quotas for women in elections have proved a very controversial measure meeting much resistance and requiring a good deal of political will. They are a mechanism more frequently used by political parties than by governments. A number of parliaments have operated a mechanism of reserved seats for women, e.g. in Bangladesh, Egypt, Nepal, Pakistan and Tanzania. The drawbacks of this system are that token women may be appointed who in actual fact have little power and lack appropriate skills, and that reserved seats may be interpreted as a ceiling for the number of women in parliament .

The transfer of power to local government through decentralization strategies which form part of democratization and governance agendas, has the potential to create spaces at the local level for women as political actors. However, efforts to increase women's representation in local politics through affirmative action or reserved seats in India and Bangladesh have shown that female councillors elected under this system may have little impact, tending not to speak in meetings, and lacking knowledge about the problems faced by women in their constituencies.

Increasing the numbers of women in decision-making positions in formal political power does not in itself translate into greater empowerment for women. Quantitative measures of women's participation in politics are inadequate as measures of women's empowerment. Measures to increase the quantity of women representatives need to be accompanied by measures to improve the quality of participation in order to support women's empowerment. More attention is needed to assess qualitatively women's empowerment through political systems.

7.3.4 Empowerment as a process

Empowerment is essentially a bottom-up process rather than something that can be formulated as a top-down strategy. Understanding empowerment in this way means that development agencies cannot claim to 'empower women'. Women must empower themselves. Devising coherent policies and programmes for women's empowerment requires careful attention, because external agencies/bodies tend to be positioned with 'power-over' target populations. The training of development professionals, in government, NGOs or donor agencies does not always equip them to consult and involve others, which is necessary for supporting empowerment.

Appropriate external support and intervention, however, can be important to foster and support the process of empowerment. Development organizations can, under some circumstances, play an enabling or facilitating role. They can ensure that their programmes work to support women's individual empowerment by encouraging women's participation, acquisition of skills, decision-making capacity, and control over resources. Agencies can support women's collective empowerment by funding women's organizations which work to address the causes of gender subordination, by promoting women's participation in political

systems, and by fostering dialogue between those in positions of power and organizations with women's empowerment goals.

7.3.5 Implications for Policy and Strategy

Adopting women's 'empowerment' as a policy goal in development organizations implies a commitment to encouraging a process of more equitable distribution of power in society on personal, economic and political levels. It implies increasing women's control over their lives both individually and collectively and their participation and influence in institutional decision making.

However, unless empowerment is clearly defined and the strategies or processes whereby it is to be translated from policy to practice specified, empowerment becomes a vague goal or meaningless buzzword. Without clear definition of the term, in the particular contexts in which they are working, development organizations run the danger of merely renaming old top-down approaches as part of an empowerment policy, without altering the content and character of their programmes or examining the need for changes in organizational culture and process required.

The analysis here suggests a number of strategic considerations for development organizations in adopting a women's empowerment approach:

1. Where women's empowerment is stated as a policy goal it should be defined or explained.
2. Strategies for promoting women's empowerment need to be integrated into development programmes.
3. Empowerment is relevant to all programmes/projects and should not be confined to one area of development activity.

4. Different aspects of empowerment (e.g. political, economic, legal, physical) should not be addressed in isolation.
5. The participation of women in planning at all stages is essential if development programmes are to be empowering.
6. Since the context is crucial to understanding processes of empowerment, indicators of empowerment need to be devised specific to programmes.
7. Mainstreaming policies within agencies and policies/programmes to support empowerment in the work of agencies should be linked.
8. Support for women's organisations is a key strategy in promoting women's empowerment.
9. Promoting empowerment also involves examining organisational culture, structures and processes and identifying where these may conflict with empowerment goals, e.g. in terms of accountability.

7.4 GENDER MAINSTREAMING

Gender mainstreaming is the process of assessing the status of men and women in all policies and programmes of Government and other organizations and also its implications. The concept of gender mainstreaming was first proposed at the 1985 Third World Conference on Women in Nairobi. The idea has been developed in the United Nations development community. The idea was formally featured in 1995 at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing.

Most definitions conform to the UN Economic and Social Council formally defined concept:

Mainstreaming a gender perspective is the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in all areas

and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women's as well as men's concerns and experiences an integral dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres so that women and men benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated. The ultimate goal is to achieve gender equality.

United Nations has defined Gender Mainstreaming as the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in all areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women's as well as men's concerns and experiences an integral dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes in all political, economic and societal spheres so that women and men benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated. Gender mainstreaming is not only a question of social justice, but is necessary for ensuring equitable sustainable human development by the most effective and efficient means.

Gender Mainstreaming makes a gender dimension explicit in all policy sectors. Gender equality is no longer viewed as a separate question, but becomes a concern for all policies and programmes. Further more, a gender mainstreaming approach does not look at women in isolation but looks at women and men – both actors in the development process, and as its beneficiaries.

Significantly gender mainstreaming differs from the women in development approach in that it takes as its starting point a thorough and rigorous analysis of the development situation, rather than a priori assumptions about women's roles and problems. Experiences have shown that gender issues differ by country, region and concrete situation. At the same time, experiences have also shown that rigorous, gender- sensitive analysis invariably reveals

gender-differentiated needs and priorities, as well as gender inequalities in terms of opportunities and outcomes. Gender mainstreaming seeks to redress these problems.

Box 4: Case Studies

1. Promoting gender equality through empowerment: The Centre for Development and Population Activities established the global better life options programme. The programme promotes opportunities for adolescent girls and boys to make better life choices concerning their health, economic status, civic participation, education, employment, decision making abilities and family planning. The programme is based on an empowerment model and combines elements of education family life education, life skills vocational training, health services and personality development. It initiated the BLT for girls based on the belief that early intervention will be most effective in improving their long-term status and empowering them to later take their place as full and equal partners with men in Indian society. It perceived that through women's empowerment would be possible and sustainable only if male support and behaviour change was forthcoming for women's issues. This shows that the need for a similar empowerment programme for adolescent boys to effectively challenge gender inequalities was also expressed by the communities and by the boys themselves.
2. A collective approach to sustainable economic development: Himalayan Action Research Centre enables the local people to organize into community-based institutions for collective action to increase their food security, socioeconomic security, promotion of livelihoods and rural market linkages. Uttarakhand is a land of rich natural and cultural heritage. The Uttarakhand people live mainly on agriculture and dairy farming. Uttarkhasi district of Uttarakhand is a Rawain

valley. On an average, 23 per cent of the population of Rawain is Scheduled Caste. Rawain Valley also had a rich tradition and culture of community-based institutions and practices of collective planning and resource management. Over the past decades these practices have declined because of the modern top-down approach. As a result, the communities's sense of ownership of decision making decreased and people become more dependent on government development programmes. The government sponsored Mahila Mangal Dals are also inactive due to lack of vision, guidance and future plan of action. By empowering mountain women through collective action HARC developed an economic development model addressing priority needs. The establishment of women's cooperatives is the major outcome of the whole process. Rawain Mahila Multipurpose Autonomous Cooperative Society Limited is the only women's federation engaged in trading activities in the state of Uttarakhand. This society built confidence among women, increased social acceptance and enhanced their decision making capacity.

7.5 GENDER PLANNING

Gender planning is the recognition of existing gender inequalities in the society and helps to formulate the policies to mitigate gender inequalities in the society. It aims to improve the status and conditions of women by formulating appropriate policies and programmes. The existing planning approach treats all as equal and it will make a plan for all without considering the inequalities existing in the society. Gender planning helps to expose,

analyze and resolve the inequalities existing in social, economic, culture, legal and family structures and serves to initiate processes of change to address inequalities in such structures and processes.

Box 5: Women's Component Plan in Kerala

It aims to provide a mechanism for special activities to ensure gender equity in society and within the family. Atleast 10 percent of the plan budget is mandated to be set apart to meet the specific needs of women. The government of Kerala initiated people's plan campaign during ninth plan period. In this campaign Women's Component Plan is also included. Long-term and short-term strategic needs of women can be addressed through Women's Component Plan to ensure overall empowerment of women. Studies revealed that the last two decades of the Women's Component Plan in the decentralized plan process in Kerala met the needs of the women and it increased women's income and enhanced the status of women through adoption of non-traditional projects carried out in some areas. Women's groups formed as transport cooperatives of women, training of women as masons, collectives for repairing of household tools, manufacture of electric equipment, paramedical training, gender education, karate and self defence training, cycling training, sport and cultural competitions. The Women's Component Plan has paved the way for women to enter the small-scale industry sector. It has also helped women in participating in the local planning process and improved their organizational ability. As part of the plan, the government of Kerala introduced 'Kudumbashree' scheme which helped women to organize collectively and involve themselves in development activities.

7.6 GENDER BUDGETING

A budget is one of the most important instruments which reflect the economic policy of the government. It can also be a powerful tool in transforming the economy at different levels of State, District or Grassroots level of village Panchayats. It reflects the choices that the government chooses in order to achieve the economic and developmental goals. Of late, Gender budgeting has emerged as a new process. This ensures the care for women's needs and priorities in the total budget. This has become an effective mechanism to bring about gender equity. A Gender Responsive Budget is a budget that acknowledges the gender patterns in the society and allocates money to implement policies and programmes that changes these patterns in a way that moves towards a more gender-equal society. Gender budget initiatives are exercises that aim to move the country in the direction of a gender-responsive budget.

Box 6: Gender Responsive Government at the Grass Roots Governance:

The enactment of 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendment of India during 1993 has enabled significant changes in the grassroots governance. As a result more than a million leaders are at the local government level as decision makers of whom one third are women. These leaders having ample opportunities to develop budgets with a gender perspective. These grassroots leaders are managing the affairs of the Gram Panchayats during the last twenty years with grants received from various sources like allocation from the government, funds for different schemes etc.

With the help of these funds the leaders undertake a number of development activities in their respective local government. Some women have taken initiatives to have gender-responsive budget in their sphere of Governance. Efforts have been taken in Karnataka with the help of UNIFEM to develop gender-responsive budget in selected Gram

Panchayats.

7.7 GENDER AUDITING

Gender auditing is the analysis of the system and process of finance of any government. Gender auditing implies auditing the income and expenditure of governments from a gender perspective and also analyzing the development process including the process of legislation, guidelines, taxes and social development projects. It understands that policies have a differential impact on men and women by recognizing the roles and responsibilities of men in the society form the basis for gender auditing. Gender auditing is the one aspect of social auditing.

Box 7: Case study: Social Audit

Over the last two decades, civil society organizations, academics, and researchers have debated different methods for measuring and improving transparency and accountability in development programmes meant for the poor. Social audits have emerged as a powerful method — one which is able to reach those areas of information reserve and bring it in the public domain, which conventional audit mechanisms and agencies have been unable to.

Unlike traditional audits, a social audit is not a one-time, but a continuous exercise, that audits expenditure, its usefulness, and its impact. It thereby tries to ensure that the activity or project is designed and implemented in a manner that is most suited for the prevailing (local) conditions, appropriately reflects the priorities and preferences of those affected by it, and most effectively serves public interest. Such a process provides for effective people's participation in monitoring expenditure and influencing decision making in the formulation and implementation of development programmes.

Accessing relevant information, consolidating it in a manner that people can easily comprehend, and facilitating a verification process by the stakeholders are some of the basic steps undertaken in a Social Audit. In doing so, the process also helps create awareness about people's rights and entitlements.

The MGNREGA and Social Audit in the Indian state of Rajasthan, a network of civil society organizations called the Rozgar Evum Suchna Ka Adhikar Abhiyan has been conducting social audits of projects under the National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MGNREGA) for close to three years now.

Passed in 2005, the Act guarantees 100 days of employment each year to any rural household whose adult members are willing to do unskilled manual work. Failure to provide work within 15 days, gives the applicant a right to claim unemployment allowance.

Despite this progress, however, most people remain unaware of their rights and entitlements under the MGNREGA. The information flow has been minimal, with the administration taking little or no initiative. Inadequate staff and lack of training have also been areas of concern.

Unlike the previous employment schemes, in the country - beset with a range of problems from lack of awareness, planning and people's participation, low quality of assets, diversion of funds and no public accountability, the MGNREGA provides for two distinct and extremely powerful legal provisions – transparency and public monitoring. The passage of the Right to Information Act (RTI) in the year 2005 — have made social audits of the MGNREGA possible and strengthened these provisions since access to information is the primary and most crucial step in conducting a Social Audit. Regular social audits since then and the presence of people's groups in certain areas have resulted in strong transparency measures, such as transparency boards at worksites

detailing the funds allocated for (and spent on) labour and material. Also, the availability of muster rolls in nearly all the worksites has considerably reduced delays in wage payment and non-payment of wages. Large numbers of men and women have attended the public hearings held as part of the audits to testify against false records and register their discontent, despite enormous pressure placed by local powers. Apart from corrupt practices and deviation of funds that get identified in these social audits, such exercises also allow a discussion on various other features of a programme, which get overlooked or unaddressed otherwise. In the case of the Abhiyan, the social audits proposed that addressing basic issues like adequate honorarium and allowance to elected representatives, increasing administrative, technical and managerial staff at the lowest level and establishing responsibility for proper maintenance of records will also clear away instances and scope for possible monetary deviations and reduce the slack in implementation resistance to Social Audits. Nearly all of the social audits conducted by the Abhiyan have been in coordination with the state government, local authorities, and field-level functionaries. The three have come together on a number of occasions to discuss findings of the social audits and worked towards correcting the problems and strengthening the MGNREGA. However, two audits recently organized by the Abhiyan in the district of Banswara and Jhalawar encountered strong resistance, even violence. Despite the strong transparency provisions in the MGNREGA and the RTI, members of the Abhiyan had to stage sit-in protests to access records. A wide array of local actors opposed the social audits, creating an air of fear and tension and making it difficult for the Abhiyan to conduct the social audit.

In Banswara, the Government of Rajasthan had itself invited the Abhiyan to do the social

audit but then refused to be a part of the process in the midst of this resistance and violence. In Jhalawar, the government's failure to provide sufficient information forced the Abhiyan to restrict itself to five panchayats (small administrative governmental units usually composed of a cluster of villages); however, the audits there uncovered evidence of embezzlement in 14 different villages. There were numerous other instances of fudged muster rolls and other problems; for example, most marginalized sections of society were either denied a job card or charged for what should have been a free document. These acts of resistance to the social audit raise fundamental questions and doubts about the government's commitment to transparency and accountability in development programs for the poor. They also expose the limits of the government's commitment to making the NREGA a healthy and successful program.

Emerging

Challenges

A social audit is fundamentally a people's process. It has given shape to the idea of public vigilance in large development programs such as the NREGA, where it is nearly impossible for one person or agency to run the program. The idea of incorporating social audits in the NREGA also reflects a decade of struggle and democratic protests by ordinary men and women who realized the importance of official information to their lives and livelihood.

The events that unfolded in Banswara and Jhalawar, however, threaten to destroy this effort. The government and the local administration sought to strengthen the existing power relations in the area by resisting the social audit, in part by reading the provisions of transparency and accountability in the narrowest possible terms — announcing that the audit could be held only under the terms they themselves established. Such resistance only shows the potential of social audits to weed out the corrupt, strengthen people's entitlements, and establish accountability. The time has come for people's groups to

redesign their strategies to meet these fresh rounds of attacks and keep alive democratic spaces and practices for those most marginalized.

Source: <http://www.mkssindia.org/node/74>, accessed on July 10, 2010.

Check your Progress Exercise 2

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. What is Women Component Plan?

2. Define Gender Budgeting and Gender Auditing.

7.8 SUMMING UP

In this Unit an attempt has been made to discuss the recent initiatives in the gender and development discourses. The process of empowerment, which is considered as the

opening up of opportunities for the deprived people has gained momentum in the recent years and the progress has been made significantly. It is both an internal and external process. While Internal processes have to happen within, external process will take place through the initiative of social and political institutions. Gender mainstreaming, gender planning, gender budgeting and gender auditing will certainly serve as tools of gender and development. But agencies are in the process of refining them to serve better.

7.9 GLOSSARY

Social Justice: Social justice generally refers to the idea of creating an egalitarian society or institution that is based on the principles of equality and solidarity, that understands and values human rights, and that recognizes the dignity of every human being.

Microfinance: Microfinance is the provision of financial services to low-income clients, including consumers and the self-employed, who traditionally lack access to banking and related services.

Micro Credit: Microcredit is the extension of very small loans (microloans) to those in poverty designed to spur entrepreneurship. These individuals lack collateral, steady employment and a verifiable credit history and therefore cannot meet even the most minimal qualifications to gain access to traditional credit.

UNIFEM: United Nations Development Fund for Women.

MGNREGA: Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act.

7.10 ANSWERS TO CHECK YOUR PROGRESS EXERCISES

Check Your Progress Exercise 1:

1. Any definition given by UNDP, OXFAM etc
2. International Conference on Population and Development and United Nations Conference on Environment and Development.

Check Your Progress Exercise 2:

1. It is introduced in ninth five year plan. Atleast 10 percent of the plan budget is mandated to be set apart to meet the specific needs of women.
2. A Gender Responsive Budget is a budget that acknowledges the gender patterns in the society and allocates money to implement policies and programmes that change these patterns in ways that moves towards a more gender equal society. Gender auditing is the analysis of the system and process of finance of any government from a gender perspective. Gender auditing implies auditing the income and expenditure of governments from a gender perspective and also analyzing the development process including the process of legislation, guidelines, taxes and social development projects.

7.11 REFERENCES

Batiwala, Srilatha, *Empowerment of Women in South Asia*, New Delhi : Asian-South Pacific Bureau of Adult Education, 1993.

Bülow, Dorthe von, Damball, Esther and Maro, Rose, *Supporting Women Groups in Tanzania Through Credit: Is This a Strategy for Empowerment*, CDR Working Papers, Copenhagen: Centre for Development Research, 1995.

Karl, Marilee, *Women and Empowerment*, London: Zed Books, 1995.

Moser, "Gender Planning in the Third World", *World Development* 17 (11), 1989.

Oxfam, *The Oxfam Handbook of Relief and Development*, Oxford: Oxfam, 1995.

Razavi, Shahrashoub, and Miller, Carol, *From WID to GAD: Conceptual Shifts in the Women and Development Discourse*, UNRISD Occasional Paper, UNRISD, Geneva, 1995.

Rowlands, J, "Empowerment examined", *Development in Practice* 5 (2), 1995

Sen, Gita with Grown, Caren, , *DAWN, Development, Crises, and Alternative Visions: Third World Women's Perspectives* New Delhi: Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era, 1985.

UN, *Report of the Fourth World Conference on Women*, Beijing, 1995.

The World's Women 1995; Trends and Statistics, New York: United Nations, 1995.

Gender budgeting Handbook of India,

wcd.nic.in/gbhb/.../Hand%20Book%20Chap%20202.pd accessed on July 10, 2010.

7.12 QUESTIONS FOR REFLECTION AND PRACTICE

1. Analyze the various definitions of empowerment.
2. What is the significance of political empowerment?
3. Examine the relationship between gender mainstreaming and social justice.
4. What is the need for gender budgeting and gender auditing?

UNIT 8: GAD INDICATORS

Structure

8.1 Introduction

8.2 Objectives

8.3 Background to GAD Indicators

8.3.1 Meaningful Indicators of Women and Development

8.4 Why look at Gender and Indicators?

8.5 The Millennium Development Goals

8.6 Examples of Gender Indicators

8.6.1 UNDPs GDI and GEM

8.6.2 Gender Related Development Index (GDI)

8.6.3 Gender Empowerment Measure

8.6.4 Critique of GDI and GEM

8.7 UNESCAP's Framework for measuring progress on the 12 critical areas of the Beijing Platform for action

8.7.1 Women and Poverty

8.7.2 Education and Training of Women

8.7.3 Women and Health

8.7.4 Violence Against Women

8.7.5 Women and Armed Conflict

8.7.6 Women and the Economy

8.7.7 Women in Power and Decision Making

8.7.8 Institutional Mechanisms for the advancement of Women

8.7.9 Human Rights of Women

8.7.10 Women and the Media

8.7.11 Women and the Environment

8.7.12 The Girl Child

8.8 Social Institutions and Gender Index (SIGI) developed by the OECD's Gender, Institutions and Development Data Base

8.9 Summing Up

8.10 Glossary

8.11 Answers to Check Your Progress Exercises

8.12 References

8.13 Questions for Reflection and Practice

8.1 INTRODUCTION

To ensure that women and men will equally contribute and benefit from the economic, social, political, cultural and environmental development of the country, appropriate measures must be undertaken to provide them with equal conditions for realizing their full rights to participate in the development process and at the same time gain from it.

However, in many countries of the world, Gender discrimination and resulting gender inequality in economic, social and political spheres is a fact of life. Understanding where, why and how gender inequality arises is a vital step in addressing gender and development problems and issues.

Efforts aimed at advancing the status of women require timely and accurate information on their situation as compared to that of men. Gender disaggregated data and statistics is needed to enhance the level of women's and men's awareness and capabilities leading to greater participation, decision making, power and control.

8.2 OBJECTIVES

After studying this Unit, you should be able to:

- Analyze the linkage between gender and development;
- Discuss gender indicators including GDI and GEM; and
- Describe UNESCAP's framework for measuring progress on the 12 critical areas of the Beijing Platform for Action.

8.3 BACKGROUND TO GAD INDICATORS

Conventional indicators of DEVELOPMENT are economic growth, rise in national and per capita income and GDP, rapid pace of urbanisation, high mobility of labour and capital, expansion of industrial base, agrarian growth and growth of foreign trade.

This thinking has been challenged by gender economists as these indicators have not taken into consideration just distribution of resources, opportunities and material wellbeing to majority of human beings, especially women.

This resulted in the development of the **Women in Development approach** which signifies awareness about marginalisation of women in society in general and in the economy in particular. Towards Equality Report, Government of India published in 1974 and The UN Charter on Equality, Development and Peace adopted in 1975 were influenced by this approach.

It is also worthwhile to note here that the **Women and Development** approach that believes in integration of women in the mainstream through Education, health and economic development of women is a guiding force for National Perspective Plan (1988-2000), GOI.

Gender and Development approach is committed to bending the existing power structure in favour of women thru' empowerment of women in the apex bodies of decision making. Convention on Elimination of (All Forms of) Discrimination Against women (CEDAW) espouses this approach.

The four global women's conferences (Mexico 1975, Copenhagen 1980, Nairobi 1985 and Beijing 1995) were instrumental in bringing women's issues center-stage in country after country by raising awareness, spreading ideas, creating important alliances and increasing confidence. These conferences also provided the mandate for CEDAW (the Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women) which was in turn responsible for the creation of UNIFEM (the UN Development Fund for Women) and

INSTRAW (the UN International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women). In addition, MDGs – gender inclusive 2000, INSTRAW-UN, visibility of women in statistics and indicators (1988), GDI and GEM by the United Nations as well as development radars developed by various countries including India.

Inter -district, Inter-state and Cross country comparisons of women's empowerment are obtained from Gender related Development Index (GDI). GDI owes its origin to its precursor, the HDI (Human Development Index), three main components of which are per capita income, educational attainment and life-expectancy which is a proxy for health attainment. Gender disparities are measured keeping these three indicators into consideration. "An additional measure, gender empowerment measure (GEM) has been formulated to take into account aspects relating to economic participation and decision-making by women. The indicators used in GEM are share in income, share in parliamentary seats and an index that includes share in administrative and managerial jobs and share in professional and technical posts".

8.3.1 Meaningful Indicators of Women and Development

Comparative data of 130 countries regarding gender-related development index (GDI) reveals that gender-equality does not depend entirely on the income level of society. **The human development approach** which focuses on demographic, health, educational and human rights profiles have revealed that there is an urgent need to reexamine this approach by conducting participatory action research and rapid rural appraisal not by social scientists alone, but in collaboration with other professionals such as scientists, doctors- occupational health and safety experts, engineers and lawyers who believe that like them, citizens from subsistence sector also have right to enjoy fruits of modern science and technology in terms of food security, safe transport, clean environment, secure housing and healthy life. India

ranked 114 in GDI and 134 in the HDI in the year 2008-2009 as, the Indian women enjoy nearly 1/5th of the total earned income, life expectancy of 63.4 years (female 64.9, male 62) and 66 % adult literacy (female 54.5 %, male 76.9 %) rate and combined primary, secondary and tertiary Gross enrollment ratio (GER) of 61% (female 57.4 % and male 64.3%). HDI for India is 0.612 and GDI for India is 0.594. As compared to their male counterparts, women in India have higher life expectancy because women from the middle and upper classes live in a secure environment, produce one or two children and control food (kitchen) of the household.

8.4 WHY LOOK AT GENDER AND INDICATORS?

Because what is measured is more likely to be prioritised and evidence gathered against indicators can help make the case that gender issues should be taken seriously.

Indicators can be used for advocacy and can help make the case for action by highlighting key issues, backed up with statistics and other evidence.

They enable better planning and actions. Gender indicators can be used to evaluate the outcomes of gender-focused and mainstream interventions and policies and help reveal barriers to achieving success. They can provide vital information for adjusting programmes and activities so that they better achieve gender equality goals and do not create adverse impacts on women and men. They can also be used to measure gender mainstreaming within organisations.

They can be used for holding institutions accountable for their commitments on gender equality. Gender indicators and relevant data can make visible the gaps between the commitments many governments and other institutions have made at all levels – for example by ratifying the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against

Women (CEDAW) – and their actual implementation and impact. They can be used to hold policy-makers accountable for their actions, or lack of action.

They can help to stimulate change through data collection processes. For example, discussions in focus groups or in individual interviews can help raise awareness of particular issues. They can stimulate discussion and inspire recognition among participants of common experiences related to sensitive topics such as GBV.

8.5 THE MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS (MDGS)

MDGS proposed by the U N Millennium Summit of September 2000 affirmed the international community's commitment to gender equality and women's empowerment. The third of the MDGs addresses gender equality specifically. Gender advocates and policymakers agreed that the achievement of this goal depended on the extent to which other goals addressed gender-based constraints. The Millennium Project Task Force on Gender and Education advocated the case for developing gender indicators for each of the MDGs. (See box)

MDGs and the importance of gender equality

Goal 1. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger

- Equal access for women to basic transport and energy infrastructure can lead to greater economic activity
- Investment in women's health and nutritional status reduces chronic hunger and malnourishment, which increases productivity and wellbeing.

Goal 2. Achieve universal primary education

- Educated girls and women have greater control fertility and participate more in

• A mother's education is a strong, consistent of her children's of her children's ent and attainment and their health and nd nutrition outcomes.

Goal 3. Promote gender equality and empower women

- This central goal dedicated to gender equality and women's empowerment depends on the achievement of all other goals for its success.

Goal 4. Reduce child mortality

- A mother's education, income, and empowerment have a significant impact on lowering child mortality.

Goal 5. Improve maternal health

- A mother's education, income, and empowerment have a significant impact on lowering maternal mortality.

Goal 6. Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases

- Greater economic independence for women, increased ability to negotiate safe sex, and more awareness of challenges around traditional norms in sexual relations are essential for preventing the spread of HIV/AIDS and other epidemics.

Goal 7. Ensure environmental Sustainability

- Gender-equitable property and resource ownership policies enable women (often as primary users of these resources) to manage them in a more sustainable manner.

Goal 8. Develop a global partnership for development

- Greater gender equality in the political sphere may lead to higher investments in development cooperation.

(Adapted from Grown *et al*)

8.6 EXAMPLES OF GENDER INDICATORS

There have been a few significant attempts at developing indicators for measuring gender related issues. Of these, three important ones are discussed here:

8.6.1 UNDP'S GDI AND GEM

On the occasion of the UN world conference in Beijing, the UNDP Human Development Bureau prepared and released The Human Development Report 1995 subtitled Gender and Human Development. The report highlighted the disparities among men and women in various indicators of Human Development around the world. The most important contribution of the report is the introduction of two special indices for measuring gendered inequality, the GDI (Gender-related Development Index) and the GEM (Gender Empowerment Measure).

8.6.2 The Gender-related Development Index (GDI)

It was in 1995 that the UNDP brought out the Gender-related Development Index as a method for assessing gender inequality. The variables used in GDI are similar to those used for the Human Development Index; these being education, health and income.

While the HDI measures average achievement, the GDI adjusts the average achievement to reflect the inequalities between men and women in the following dimensions:

- A long and healthy life, as measured by life expectancy at birth.
- Knowledge as measured by the adult literacy rate and the combined primary, tertiary and gross enrolment ratio.
- A decent standard of living, as measured by estimated earned income (PPP US\$).

8.6.3 The Gender Empowerment Measure (GEM)

Focusing on women's opportunities rather than their capabilities, the GEM captures gender inequality in three key areas:

- Political participation and decision making power, as measured by women's and men's percentage share of parliamentary seats.
- Economic participation and decision-making power, as measured by two indicators – women's and men's percentage shares of positions as legislators, senior officials and managers and women's and men's percentage share of professional and technical positions.
- Power over economic resources, as measured by women's and men's estimated earned income (PPP US\$).

Box:1 Some Facts from the Human Development Report 2009

HDR 2009 ranks 155 countries on a global scale in terms of their GDI. It is clear from the GDI

estimates that in no society do women enjoy the same opportunities as men. The top rank is enjoyed by Australia with a GDI value of 0.966 – compared with a maximum possible value of 1.000 showing perfect equality. Most of the countries with a high GDI are also countries with high HDI since GDI is discounted (for gender inequality) HDI. Therefore an interesting data to analyse is the gap between a country's GDI rank and its HDI rank since this shows how equitably basic human capabilities are distributed between men and women. The countries showing GDI ranks markedly higher than their HDI ranks include – Belgium, Spain, Finland, Denmark, Barbados among the countries with Very High Human development ($HDI > 0.8$) and Bulgaria, Romania, Trinidad and Tobago among the High Human Development and only Mongolia and Tonga among the countries with Medium Human Development ($0.8 > HDI > 0.5$) and none from the countries with Low Human Development ($HDI < 0.5$). So we may say that poverty is bad for gender equity but the reverse is not true meaning not all countries with High Human Development have small gaps in their HDI and GDI ranks. It is -9 for Austria, -6 for USA, Kuwait and UAE, -5 in case of Ireland and Luxembourg which are among the very High Human Development list, among high Human Development list Saudi Arabia is worst at -7, among Medium Human Development countries Jordan and Syrian Arab Republic has -8 and none of the low human development countries have less than -1. Therefore as mentioned by the HDR 1995, "Income is not the decisive factor. The decision to invest in the health and education of people, irrespective of gender, seems to cut across income levels, political ideologies, cultures and stages of development."

The report also ranks the countries on their GEMs (109 countries for which data is available. The top four countries in this list are in the Nordic belt –Sweden, Norway, Finland, Denmark, in that order. This is hardly surprising. These countries have adopted gender equality and women's empowerment as conscious national policies in order to end the relative deprivation of women. GEM brings out the gender inequity more sharply. Japan with only 12% women in industrial

positions and a similar percentage of women in parliament and 0.45 as the ratio of estimated female to male earned income (which are some of the components of GEM) has the dubious distinction of having the 57th rank in terms of GEM in spite of a much higher rank for HDI (10th). Similar dismal situation is shared by some other countries such as: Ireland (22nd and 5th), Republic of Korea (61st and 26th), Qatar (88th and 33rd), Saudi Arabia (106th and 59th). On the other hand a relatively low income countries such as Trinidad and Tobago shows a high GEM rank of 14 while on the 64th position in terms of HDI. Similar examples include Philippines (59, 105), Kyrgyzstan (56, 120), South Africa (26, 129) etc.

Source: UNDP (2009) Human Development Report

8.6.4 Critique of GDI and GEM

The GDI has been criticized for failing to take into account important aspects such as the quality of community life, human rights and access to basic amenities. Issues as violence against women or restrictions placed on women's capacity to be mobile or household allocation of resources do not get any reflection in the GDI. Income or education levels can not fully capture the specific disadvantages experienced by women.

Recognizing the importance of gender based power imbalances, the UNDP has recognised the fact that movement to gender equality is a political process. For this the Gender Empowerment Measure has been formulated to reflect variables that take into consideration women's political participation, their access to professional positions and their earning power.

The GEM is also criticized because it too is based only on three variables and therefore defines empowerment very narrowly. It ignores legal and human rights and does not take into account cultural constructions and related practices that disempower women.

The GEM has also been criticized on the grounds that its components were related to characteristics of power more appropriate to the developed countries. The argument was that there would not be professional associations of women and there would be few women in parliament in developing countries, but in these countries participation of women in other types of organisations such as cooperatives, trade associations and community organizations may indicate empowerment which is not reflected in the statistics on which GEM is based.

It has been argued that majority of women in underdeveloped countries are doing work that is invisible to valuation in the mainstream male-defined world of statistics relating to work and income. The GDI and GEM indices based on per capita income and work participations rates therefore, are not accurate measures for the developing countries.

Check Your Progress Exercise 1

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer this question.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this Unit.

1. Explain the importance of gender indicators.

.....

.....

.....

.....

2. Explain the major differences between GDI and GEM.

8.7 UNESCAP'S FRAMEWORK FOR MEASURING PROGRESS ON THE 12 CRITICAL AREAS OF THE BEIJING PLATFORM FOR ACTION

In October 1999, ESCAP (the Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific) of the UN (United Nations), organized the High-level Intergovernmental Meeting to Review Regional Implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action. The meeting was convened to review the progress made and the obstacles encountered in implementing the 12 critical areas of the Platform for Action. Subsequently at its twenty-third special session entitled “Women 2000: gender equality, development and peace for the twenty-first century” (Beijing⁺⁵), the General Assembly adopted a political declaration and an outcome document on further actions and initiatives to implement the Platform. The political declaration recognised that governments have primary responsibility for implementation of the 12 critical areas of concern. The Platform specifically recommends the designing of gender-sensitive indicators with special reference to the issues of poverty, economic activity and violence. Governments agreed to regularly assess further implementation of the Platform with a view to bringing together in 2005 all parties involved to assess progress and consider new initiatives. In this context, the need for a road map of indicators to inform policy makers on the progress or reverses in the situation of women in the countries was acutely felt.

A set of guidelines for developing gender-based indicators (both quantitative and qualitative) in the ESCAP region was developed and proposed by the expert group that met for this purpose from December 2 to 4, 2002 with the objective of providing accurate measurements of change in the situation of women occurring over time and for comparisons between countries in the region. The proposed indicators are briefly explained below:

8.7.1 Women and Poverty

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Population below the National Poverty line (Percentage)
- Population living on Less than US \$1 per day (Percentage)
- Public assistance beneficiary rate (Percentage, by sex)
- Female-headed households below poverty line (Percentage)
- Policies and programmes supporting female household heads with low income (Yes/No, Key Features)
- Legislation ensuring equal inheritance rights to women (Yes/No, Key features and enforcement situation)
- Legislation ensuring equal property ownership rights to women (Yes/No, Key features and enforcement situation)
- Credit programmes for women in poverty (Yes/No, Key Features)
- Policies and programmes on gender-based research on poverty, including social security systems (Yes/No, Key Features)
- Production and distribution of sex-disaggregated statistics on poverty (Yes/No, List Key Statistics)

8.7.2 Education and Training of Women

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Gender difference in average years of schooling (By sex)
- Gross and net enrolment ratio (Percentage, by sex, level of education)
- Female students in tertiary education (Percentage by field of education)
- Ratification of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Yes/No, Year of Ratification)
- Adult illiteracy rate (Percentage, by sex, age group, rural/urban)
- Vocational training enrolment rate (Percentage by sex, field of study)
- Policies and programmes for women in science and technology (Yes/No, Key Features)
- Women in information and communication technology (ICT) (Percentage by industry, level)
- Access to computers, Internet (Percentage by sex, urban/rural)
- National programmes to reduce gender stereotypes in school curricular and textbooks (Yes/No, Key Features)

8.7.3 Women and Health

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Life expectancy at birth (By sex)
- Calorie intake (By sex, age, group)
- Pregnant women with anemia (Percentage)
- Deliveries attended by skilled health personnel (Percentage)

- Maternal mortality rate (Percentage)
- Induced abortion rate (Percentage)
- Contraception practice rate (Percentage, by sex, methods)
- Health education for women (Yes/No)
- Gender sensitive policies and programmes to prevent HIV/AIDS. (Yes/No, Key features)
- Medical research fund for women's health issues (Percentage of total, Key features)

8.7.4 Violence Against Women

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Incidences of domestic violence (Per 100, 000 people, graph of reported and convicted cases)
- Incidences of sexual violence (Per 100, 000 people, graph of reported and convicted cases)
- Legislation against gender based violence (yes/No, Types of violence covered and enforcement situation)
- Support system for female victims of violence (yes/no, list available services and budget)
- Production of statistics on gender-based violence (Yes/No, List key statistics)
- Fund for research on violence against women (Yes/No, Amount of funds)
- Ratification of international conventions on trafficking in and enslavement of people (Yes/No, Year of ratification)
- Legislation combating sex tourism and trafficking of women (Yes/No, Key features and enforcement situation)

- Incidences of prostitution and trafficking (Numbers of cases filed and convicted)
- Services for female victims of exploitations by prostitution and trafficking (Yes/No, Key features)

8.7.5 Women and Armed Conflict

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Women in peace-related decision-making (Percentage, background of women)
- Policies and programmes ensuring women's participation in peace process (Yes/No, Key features)
- Ratification of the Convention on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons, which may be deemed to be Excessively Injurious and the Protocol on Prohibitions or Restrictions on the use of Mines, Booby traps and other Devices (Yes/No, year of Ratification)
- Military expenditure (Percentage of the total government expenditure and GDP)
- Ratification of Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court (Yes/No, year of Ratification)
- Policies and programmes preventing human rights abuses of women in conflict situation(Yes/No, Key features)
- Gender sensitive peace education (Yes/No, Key features of programme and participants)
- Programmes for refugee and displaced women (Yes/No. Key features)

8.7.6 Women and the Economy

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Labour force, economic participation and unemployment rates (Percentage by sex)

- Policies and programmes to implement the 1993 United Nations System of National Accounts (SNA) (Yes/No, Key features)
- Equal employment opportunity law and Legislation ensuring equal pay for work of equal value and Legislation for prevention of sexual harassment at workplace (Yes/No. Key features and enforcement situation)
- Programmes to enhance women's income generating potential and to support women entrepreneurs (Yes/No, By rural, urban, Key features)
- Vocational training, counselling and placement services for women (Yes/No, percentage received service by sex, by training)
- Legislation protecting women in the informal sector (Yes/No, coverage)
- Ratification of ILO conventions (Yes/No, List ratified conventions and year of ratification)
- Women in managerial positions (Percentage, by occupation and subsector)
- Participation of women in labour unions (Percentage, by position)
- Lengths of paid maternity leave (days, List state and public payment provisions)

8.7.7 Women in Power and Decision making

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Women in parliament (Percentage)
- Women in ministerial posts (Percentage)
- Women in political parties (Percentage by level of position)
- Women in government committees (Percentage)
- Women in central government (Percentage, by rank)
- Women in local government (Percentage, by rank, elected/non-elected)

- Affirmative action for women in political parties (Yes/No, Key features)
- Women voters (Percentage)
- Training for women political candidates and for female government officials (Yes/No, Key features)
- Leadership training for women in NGOs, trade unions and business organizations (Yes/No, list programmes)

8.7.8 Institutional Mechanisms for the Advancement of Women

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- National machinery for women's advancement and gender equality (Yes/No, by level, list mandates, numbers of staff and budget)
- Gender focal points in different ministries (Yes/No, level of position, list mandates)
- Gender – sensitivity training for government officials (Yes/No, key features)
- Institutionalization of gender analysis of government policies (Yes/No)
- Inter-ministerial gender policy coordinating body (Yes/No, Key features including mandates)
- Gender caucus in the parliament (Yes/No, Key features including mandates)
- Publication of gender statistics and indicators on regular basis (Yes/No, Specify type of Publication)
- Time use survey (Yes/No, Year of Survey)

8.7.9 Human Rights of Women

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Ratification of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) and optional protocols (Yes/No, Year of ratification)
Number of reservations to CEDAW (Number, list articles/paragraphs and reservations removed)
- Legislation protecting women's human rights (Yes/No, Key features and enforcement situation)
- National action plans to protect women's human rights (Yes/No, key features, including monitoring mechanisms)
- National Commission on human rights (Yes/No, Existence of women's division, percentage of women commissioners)
- Revision of gender discriminatory laws in accordance with CEDAW (Yes/No, list revised laws)
- Gender – sensitivity training for people in legislative, judiciary and law enforcement system (Yes/No, Key features)
- Legal literacy education for women (Yes/No, list measures taken to ensure women at the grass roots are included)
- Education on women's human rights. (Yes/No, list measures taken to ensure women at the grassroots are included)

8.7.10 Women and the Media

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Women professionals in electronic and print media (percentage, by type of media, level of position, women in decisionmaking positions)

- Training for women in new communication technologies (Yes/No, list measures taken to ensure women at the grassroots are included)
- Media literacy education for women and the general public (Yes/No)
- Institutionalization of gender sensitivity training for media professionals (Yes/No)
- Legislation against pornography, violence, portrayal of women as sex objects, and commercial exploitation in media (Yes/No, Key features including monitoring mechanisms)
- Codes of conduct and guidelines on balanced portrayal of women (Yes/No, Key features including monitoring mechanisms)
- Support for women's media monitoring activities (Yes/No, key features including level of funding)

8.7.11 Women and the Environment

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Women in environmental decision-making bodies (Percentage, by types)
- Leadership training for women on environmental and resource management (Yes/No, list key features and measures taken to ensure women at the grassroots are included)
- Gender analysis of environmental policies and programmes (Yes/No)
- Programmes promoting women's role in environmentally sound production (Yes/No, list programmes)
- Database of women's indigenous knowledge on resource management and environment preservation (Yes/No, Key features)
- Implementation of Chapter 24 of Agenda 21 (Yes/No, monitoring mechanisms)

8.7.12 The Girl Child

IMPORTANT INDICATORS:

- Legislation ensuring equal inheritance rights of the girl child (Yes/No)
- Legislation ensuring the minimum legal age for marriage (Yes/No, Key features and enforcement situation)
- Sex ratio at birth (By Birth order)
- Policies to promote girl's access to education (Yes/No, List Key features)
- Infant and under age 5 mortality rate (Per 1,000 live births by sex)
- Infant with low birth weight and malnutrition of children under 5 (Percentage, by Sex)
- Education for girls and boys on sexual behavior and reproductive health (Yes/No)
- Children aged between 10 and 14 in employment (Percentage, by Sex)
- Legislation preventing child abuse, female infanticide, prenatal sex selection, incest, child prostitution and child pornography (Yes/No, Key features and enforcement situation)
- Parental education and counseling on gender-sensitive parenting. (Yes/No)

8.8 SOCIAL INSTITUTIONS AND GENDER INDEX (SIGI) DEVELOPED BY THE OECD'S GENDER , INSTITUTIONS AND DEVELOPMENT DATABASE

The Gender, Institutions and Development Database (GID-DB) was introduced by the OECD on the International Women's Day 2006 to determine and analyze obstacles to realization of gender equality. The SIGI was constructed as a new measure of gender equality. While the conventional indicators focused on the outcomes of inequality, the SIGI measures inequalities based on social institutions like norms, traditions and informal laws.

The index of social institutions is a tool for capturing the underlying reasons for the gender gaps in 102 non-OECD countries.

The SIGI has introduced 12 indicators on social institutions which are grouped into 5 categories: Family Code, Physical Integrity, Son Preference, Civil Liberties and Ownership Rights

Family Code includes institutions that influence the decision making power of the women in the household.

- **Early marriage** measures the percentage of girls between the ages of 15 and 19 who are married, divorced or widowed. This provides an indication of forced or arranged marriages as a gender related variable.
- **Polygamy** refers to the acceptance within a society of men having multiple wives.
- **Parental authority** measures whether women have same rights to be legal guardians of their children and whether they have custody rights after divorce.
- **Inheritance** measures whether widows and daughters have equal rights as heirs

Physical Integrity consists of two variables on violence against women:

- **Violence against women** measures the existence of legal protection for women against rape, assault and sexual harassment.
- **Female genital mutilation** measures the extent and incidences of this practice.

Son Preference measures gender bias in mortality due to the practice of sex selective abortions and inadequate care given to girls.

Civil Liberties refers to the freedom of social participation of women.

- **Freedom of movement** measures the restrictions women face in moving freely outside their household without being escorted by male family members.
- **Freedom of dress** measures the obligations to observe a certain dress code in public.

Ownership Rights include three variables:

- **Women's access to land**
- **Women's access to property other than land**
- **Women's access to credit**

Check Your Progress Exercise 2

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this Unit.

1. Write the important indicators to understand the interlinkages between women and the economy as well as women and the environment.

2. What is SIGI and how can it be an important tool for achieving women's equality?

8. 9 SUMMING UP

The choice of what to measure will be different for different actors. Governments might be concerned with monitoring progress for women and men, development agencies might focus on evaluating the impact of their gender programmes, while gender equality activists may be measuring gender (in)equality or (in)justice.

Good practice when developing indicators

Although there is often a temptation to simply apply universal templates and frameworks, it is important to adapt indicators so that they are relevant. To be meaningful and illuminating, indicators need to be derived in consultation with local people, and to reflect the gender context of a particular region, country or community. Indicators should take into account statutory and customary laws, as well as reflecting the ways in which gender inequalities are experienced and expressed. Only then can they convey what would constitute meaningful change for the people involved in or being affected by the donor policy.

Key questions to be asked when designing gender indicators

Some questions that should be asked in the design and review stages of developing gender indicators include:

- What change do you want to see? What would success look like? How will people's gender or sexuality affect the way they understand and experience these changes?
- Who should be involved in defining the vision of change, determining the indicators and gathering data?
- Are there existing national indicators that could be used or adapted?
- What legal frameworks exist that may enable or inhibit gender equality? For example, does national law prohibit violence against women, or GBV more broadly? These frameworks can provide the basis for indicators.
- Has CEDAW and its Optional Protocol been ratified? If so, this can offer a framework for developing indicators.
- What information already exists, or is being collected, to assist in tracking changes? What relevant research and reports on the indicator already exist? If there is no data, what does that tell you and where might you look?
- Do partner governments have the political will to undertake data collection around the gender indicators selected? And were they consulted in the formulation of the indicators? Do they have the capacity to collect data?
- How can you ensure small changes will be measured? There is increasing pressure on donors to “manage for results” – to demonstrate significant changes in a fixed period. It is, however, important to consider which indicators could capture the often small, nuanced shifts in gender equality, that tend to happen over time.
- How will the data collected be analysed and disseminated? And how will the results be used for learning and feedback into programme/project learning and design?

Recommendations

- Identify the objectives and goals – your “vision of change.” This should be the basis for choosing appropriate gender indicators against which to track progress.
- Consider a combination of qualitative and quantitative data to generate richer data.
- Use participatory approaches wherever possible, including in defining gender indicators.
- Use gender indicators to assess the outcomes and impacts of gender mainstreaming.
- Support and strengthen local statistics offices to produce gender responsive data.
- Make regular gender evaluations or internal audits mandatory.

8.10 GLOSSARY

UNITED NATIONS:

The United Nations is an international organization founded in 1945 after the Second World War by 51 countries committed to maintaining international peace and security, developing friendly relations among nations and promoting social progress, better living standards and human rights. Due to its unique international character, and the powers vested in its founding Charter, the Organization can take action on a wide range of issues, and provide a forum for its 192 Member States to express their views, through the General Assembly, the Security Council, the Economic and Social Council and other bodies and committees.

The work of the United Nations reaches every corner of the globe. Although best known for peacekeeping, peacebuilding, conflict prevention and humanitarian assistance, there are many other ways the United Nations and its System (specialized agencies, funds and programmes) affect our lives and make the world a better place. The Organization works

on a broad range of fundamental issues, from sustainable development, environment and refugees protection, disaster relief, counter terrorism, disarmament and non-proliferation, to promoting democracy, human rights, gender equality and the advancement of women, governance, economic and social development and international health, clearing landmines, expanding food production, and more, in order to achieve its goals and coordinate efforts for a safer world for this and future generations.

OECD: Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development. OECD brings together the governments of countries committed to democracy and the market economy from around the world to:

- Support sustainable economic growth
- Boost employment
- Raise living standards
- Maintain financial stability
- Assist other countries' economic development
- Contribute to growth in world trade

The Organisation provides a setting where governments compare policy experiences, seek answers to common problems, identify good practice and coordinate domestic and international policies.

UNESCAP:

The United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) is the regional development arm of the United Nations for the Asia-Pacific region. With a membership of 62 Governments, 58 of which are in the region, and a geographical scope that stretches from Turkey

in the west to the Pacific island nation of Kiribati in the east, and from the Russian Federation in the north to New Zealand in the south, ESCAP is the most comprehensive of the United Nations five regional commissions. It is also the largest United Nations body serving the Asia-Pacific region with over 600 staff.

Established in 1947 with its headquarters in Bangkok, Thailand, ESCAP seeks to overcome some of the region's greatest challenges. It carries out work in the following areas:

- Macroeconomic Policy and Development
- Statistics
- Sub regional activities for development
- Trade and Investment
- Transport
- Environment and sustainable development
- Information and Communications Technology and Disaster Risk Reduction
- Social Development

ESCAP focuses on issues that are most effectively addressed through regional cooperation, including:

- Issues that all or a group of countries in the region face, for which it is necessary to learn from each other;
- Issues that benefit from regional or multi-country involvement;
- Issues that are transboundary in nature, or that would benefit from collaborative inter-country approaches;

- Issues that are of a sensitive or emerging nature and require further advocacy and negotiation.

ESCAP secretariat comprises the Office of the Executive Secretary, seven substantive Divisions (MPDD, TID, TD, ED, IDD, SDD, and SD), the Administrative Services Division, and the Programme Management Division.

The delivery of ESCAP's programmes is supported by the regional institutions and the sub regional offices.

Purchasing Power Parity (PPP): PPP is a theory of long-term equilibrium exchange rates based on relative price levels of two countries. In its "absolute" version, the purchasing power of different currencies is equalized for a given basket of goods. In the "relative" version, the difference in the rate of change in prices at home and abroad—the difference in the inflation rates—is equal to the percentage depreciation or appreciation of the exchange rate.

PPP exchange rate (the "real exchange rate") fluctuations are mostly due to different rates of inflation between the two economies. Aside from this volatility, consistent deviations of the market and PPP exchange rates are observed, for example (market exchange rate) prices of non-traded goods and services are usually lower where incomes are lower. (A U.S. dollar exchanged and spent in India will buy more haircuts than a dollar spent in the United States). Basically, PPP takes into account as if there was a standard international Currency used by all countries and determining the cost for that measure. In other words, PPP is the amount of a certain basket of basic goods which can be bought in the given country with the standard international currency.

8.11 ANSWERS TO CHECK YOUR PROGRESS EXERCISE

Check Your Progress Exercise 1:

1. Planning, accountability of institutions, data collection and MDGs.)
2. GDI similar to HDI; GEM focuses on gender capabilities

Check Your Progress Exercise 2:

1. Labour Force, Economic Participation, Unemployment rate, equal employment opportunity, laws and legislations, policies and programmes, women position in occupation and subsector wise, participation of women in labour unions and lengths of paid maternity leave.
2. SIGI measures inequalities based on social institutions like norms, traditions and informal laws. SIGI has 12 indicators on social institutions which are grouped into five categories. The Gender institutions and development data base (GID-DB) was introduced by the OECD on the international women's day 2006 to determine and analyse obstacles to realization of gender equality. It is a new measure. Unlike conventional indicators which are focused on the outcomes of inequality the SIGI measures inequalities based on social institutions.

8.12 REFERENCES

Grown, C., Rao Gupta, G. and Kes, A, *Taking Action: Achieving Gender Equality and Empowering Women*, UN Millennium Project Task Force on Education and Gender Equality, London and Sterling, VA: Earthscan, 2005
<http://www.unmillenniumproject.org/documents/Gender-complete.pdf>

Mehta, Asha Kapur , "Recasting Indices for Developing Countries, a Gender Empowerment Measure", *Economic and Political Weekly*XXXI, no. 43 (26 October 1996)

Moser, Caroline, *Gender Planning and Development-Theory, Practice and Development* , New York:Routledge, 1993.

Patel, Vibhuti and Karne Manisha, *The Macroeconomic Policies and the Millennium Development Goals*, New Delhi: Gyan Publishers, 2007.

Moser, Annalise , *Gender and Indicators: Overview Report*, Bridge Development Gender, UNDP, 2007 <http://www.bridge.ids.ac.uk/reports/IndicatorsORfinal.pdf>

‘Gender Indicators for monitoring the implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action on Women in the ESCAP region available at www.unescap.org/ESID/GAD/Publication/Gender-Indicators.pdf

Human Development Report 1995, UNDP

Human Development Report 2009, UNDP

8.13 QUESTIONS FOR REFLECTION AND PRACTICE

1. How is gender equality brought out in the Millennium Development Goals of the UNDP?
 2. Discuss UNDP’s gender indicators: GDI and GEM. Are they complete in themselves?
 3. What are the guidelines for developing gender based indicators as given by UNESCAP ?
 4. What indicators could be developed for ensuring equal rights for the girl child?
-

UNIT 9 GENDER DIMENSIONS IN PLANNING AND POLICY MAKING

Structure

9.1 Introduction

9.2 Objectives

9.3 Gender Blind and Gender Neutral Approach

9.4 Gender Biased Approach

9.5 Rights Based Approach

9.6 Gender Positive Approach

9.7 Sunning Up

9.8 Glossary

9.9 Answers to Check your Progress Exercises

9.10 References

9.11 Questions for Reflection and Practice

9.1 INTRODUCTION

The goal of gender planning is the emancipation of women from their subordinate position in the society and to attain equality, equity and empowerment. This process is being initiated by women's movement, feminist thinking, and measures taken at the national and international level. The intensity of action will vary accordingly in different countries depending on their subordination, their status vis a vis men and also depending on the nature of the society and the State. The contribution of feminists to the development debates led to the origin of different approaches like WID, WAD, GID and GAD. Based on these approaches, tools and techniques were developed to incorporate women issues in the development process. This exercise was started in the 1970s in the developing countries. The Status of Women in India Report 1974 and signing of UN conventions related to

empowerment of women by the Government of India paved the way for the inclusion of women-specific and gender-specific policies and programmes in the planning process. In order to analyze the policies and programmes from a gender perspective, there are different approaches. These approaches are discussed in this Unit.

9.2 OBJECTIVES

After studying this Unit, you should be able to

- Describe different types of approaches involved in gender planning;
- Discuss the merits and demerits of different approaches; and
- Evaluate and Analyse planning and policy making from a gender perspective.

9.3 THE GENDER-BLIND AND GENDER-NEUTRAL APPROACHES

Gender, as you know, is socially and culturally constructed and expected differences between men and women. “Gender-blind approach does not consider these differences existing between men and women, rather it views men and women belong” to the same category. Gender-blindness refers to a failure to identify or acknowledge difference on the basis of gender where it is significant. This approach does not recognize gender as an essential factor that determines the choices for men and women separately in the society. Persons or institutions or policies based on this approach consider both men and women as a homogeneous category and they become blind towards their differential needs. This approach does not question the existing norms and values that discriminate against women and focuses only on the development of communities, households, agricultural sector in general. Moreover, gender-blind policies display ignorance about the gender differences in the allocation of roles and resources and accept the universal norms of the society as such which is patriarchal in nature. Therefore the gender policies even though meant for development

cannot be fruitful as they ignore the differences in resources, entitlements, opportunities, influence between men and women. Women are hence left out and do not get benefits.

If a gender-blind approach is taken in policy formulation two major problems will arise. Firstly, women are not recognized as important in development processes and simply not included at the level of policy formulation. Secondly, development policy, even when aware of the important role women play in development processes, because of certain assumptions still miss women and consequently fail to develop coherently formulated gender policy. Even if the policy is formulated, implementation in practice has different problems due to culture, traditional norms and gender roles. If gender policy is not implemented due to technical constraints in the form of inappropriate planning processes or due to political constraints, then there is no need for such policies and even if it is implemented it will not be a successful policy in bringing gender equality. Grindle, identifies the manner in which social and structural constraints influence the implementability of programmes arguing that people and groups aiming to transform social relations generally meet with opposition from groups whose interest they threaten. She maintains that the content of policy has considerable impact on the kind of political activity stimulated by the policy making process. She claims that implementation is an ongoing process of decision making influenced by a variety of factors, the ultimate outcome of which is determined by the content of the programme being pursued and by the interaction between decision makers within a given politico-administrative context.

Similarly, planning methodologies are viewed as gender-neutral. This is due to the separation of conception of planning from the reality. The planning is viewed as public sector activity and the institutions which are involved in this process are neutral and they are acting for public good. The signatory countries of UN International Conventions is implementing number of women-specific programmes but their budgets are gender-neutral without

considering the specific needs of women. We can analyze this statement by going through the following case study.

A budget appears to be a gender-neutral policy instrument but this is more accurately described as gender-blind. The way the national budget is usually formulated ignores the different, socially determined roles, responsibilities and capabilities of men and women. A gender-sensitive budget analysis is an attempt to establish the differential impact of the government budget on men and women. It is an effort to recognize the fact that important functions of the budget such as allocation of resources between different programmes and policies, distribution of income and wealth for equity considerations and functions of the budget to promote stability, employment and economic growth may have different implications for men and women. Gender-sensitive budgets seek to uncover these.

Australia was the first country to introduce a gender-sensitive budget analysis. Each government agency was required to provide an audit of the annual government budget of government's achievements in relation to women and girls. This was required to be done not only for expenditures directly allocated to women and girls but for all expenditures. Women's budget statement for 1995-96 in Australia covered reports on the implementation of policies that are important in achieving government's goals in relation to women and girls (Department of Treasury, Commonwealth of Australia, 1995). Other countries where gender-sensitive budget analyses have been initiated are South Africa, Barbados, and Mozambique. Work on some selected portfolios of the government is also being taken up in Namibia, Sri Lanka and Tanzania.

As a first step to a gender-sensitive budget analysis, there is a need to categorize the budgets of each Ministry of the Government, to identify their focus on women in terms of

exclusive focus, sub-component on women or no (gender-neutral) focus. This will help us to answer crucial questions such as:

- What share of the total government budget and public expenditure do the exclusive schemes for women constitute?
- Which Ministries have programmes with a gender component and what is the nature of these components?
- Which Ministries do not have any schemes with a focus on women? Are these typically more growth related Ministries (and not soft social sectors) such as Ministry of Information Technology, Industry and Commerce, etc.

However, we need to recognize that even with schemes directly aimed at women or where a particular scheme has components on women, the benefit may not actually reach women, given various socio-economic factors and the underpinning gender relations. For example, an education programme aimed at girls education may not have a beneficial impact on girls if girls are not able to attend schools due to their child care and other domestic responsibilities. There is need to recognize the working of the unpaid economy and the constraints faced by women and girls due to the underlying gender relations and socially determined roles for women. For such an analysis, detailed assessment of programmes in terms of their impact on men and women is required. This would require discussions with officials, concerned NGOs and the persons for whom the budgets and schemes are meant. There is a general lack of gender disaggregated data which makes separate assessments for men and women difficult. We therefore need to establish procedures for collection and compilation of such data.

The following table gives an example of the allocation made on women-specific schemes in the programme of Government of India Budget.

Table 9.1: Budgeted outlay on women specific schemes in the GOI budget, 2000-2001

	Ministries/Departments/schemes of the Government of India	2000-2001 Budget allocation (Rs. Million)	% share in total central Governme nt Budget
I	MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE		
i	Department of Health		
	Lady Harding Medical College & Sucheta Kriplani Hospital	448.8	0.013
	Development of nursing services	173.0	0.005
ii	Department of Family welfare		
	Reproductive & child health project	9510.0	0.281
II	MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT		
i	Dept. of Elementary Education & Literacy		
	Shiksha Karmi Project	261.2	0.008
	Mahila Samakhya	99.0	0.003
	National programme for women education	1600.0	0.047

ii	Dept. of Secondary education & higher education		
	Assistance for Boarding/hostel facilities for girl students	50.0	0.001
iii	Department of women and child development	15120.0	0.447
III	MINISTRY OF LABOUR		
	Improvement in working conditions of child/women labour	362.0	0.011
IV	MINISTRY OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT		
	National Social Assistance Programme	6435.0	0.190
V	MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS		
i	Girls Hostel	120.0	0.004
VI	MINISTRY OF SOCIAL JUSTICE & EMPOWERMENT		
i	Girls Hostel	84.0	0.002
ii	Special Education Programme for girls belonging to Scheduled Castes of very low literacy level	20.0	0.001
	TOTAL	34283.0	1.013

Source: Manju Senapaty Paper presented at the Inter-Agency Workshop on Improving the Effectiveness of Integrating Gender into Government Budgets organised by Commonwealth Secretariat, London, 26-27 April 2000.

Like the gender-blind approach the 'gender-neutral' approach is also viewed as 'treating everyone the same'. In a gender-neutral approach, structural inequalities between men and women are not addressed and policies are not framed according to the unique needs of the people. The historical subordination of women is not paid attention to while making the policies. Measures are not taken to provide substantive equality in the gender-neutral approach. In terms of gender, policy makers must distinguish between the differing needs of women and men. To do this, however, they must recognize the historic inequalities experienced by women. In March 2006, at a seminar in Belfast on how to promote and apply CEDAW effectively, Shanthi Dairiam from Malaysia, a member of the United Nations examining committee for CEDAW, stated her conviction that 'Gender equality can be discrimination'. She explained that identical treatment of women and men can be discriminatory and that unequal treatment might be necessary in order to bring about substantive equality. Discrimination can be unintended and indirect through the application of a 'neutral' policy which has the effect of disadvantaging women. She gave an example from South-East Asia whereby the requirement for collateral impacts women because few women in South-East Asia have property that could be used as collateral. The pitfalls of 'gender neutrality' can be seen most concretely in terms of how to deal with gender-based violence. An increasing number of men's groups and commentators in Ireland have been arguing that violence in intimate relationships should be treated as gender-neutral. The underlying assumption is that women's violence against men is pervasive and equivalent to men's violence against women. We would argue, on the contrary, that structural inequalities of power between women and men in economic, social and cultural spheres are the broader context in which violence against women needs to be understood. The weight of all the evidence in Ireland and globally is that men are the perpetrators of violence in intimate relations over 90% of the time. Therefore it is essential that organizations and individuals

working on violence in intimate relationships address the gender-based inequalities of power which underpin violence. Early versions of the Gender Equality Strategy tended towards this gender-neutral approach, as it focused on equal opportunities for both sexes, and confined its scope to ‘men and women, those with dependents and those without and the transgendered’. The multiple identities of women – race, age, sexual orientation, disability – were ignored. The approach failed to acknowledge the factors that prevent women from being able to compete on equal terms with men and failed to consider the use of positive action measures to redress inequalities in the workplace and in public life. The Gender Equality Strategy as it now exists acknowledges the historical disadvantage experienced by women and does advocate some positive action measures. We will be working to ensure that the strategy continues to be pro-active in tackling issues identified by women, while at the same time supporting actions in the Male Action Plan developed in response to the specific needs identified by men.

This neutral approach can be easily understood by reading the following example.

Box 1: Gender and Disaster

Natural disaster does not treat all people equally as for the social disasters. The consequences would be worst for those who come from different class background, especially the poor, workers, villagers and from different gender positions and roles, especially, women, children, elderly, handicapped and the sick. The 2004 tsunami in Tamil Nadu, the 1994 super cyclone in Orissa and the earth quake in Gujarat in 2001 have given an ample example of how neutral policies of Government, International Aid agencies and the non-Governmental agencies affected women and the marginalized.

The impact of Natural Disasters differs for different genders. Heavier damages can be seen especially in fragile and easily affected societies and the recovery and reconstruction process

takes longer because of this reason especially for women, the aged, children and the disabled people who are seriously affected by the destruction caused by the natural disasters. Women and men are experiencing the surrounding conditions differently. Due to gender based inequalities the outcome of the disasters can be experienced differently before, during and after a disaster. The gender difference can put women into vulnerable position. The field study about disasters in India shows that the privileged men in the community demand priority in the relief, rehabilitation and reconstruction process. Internalization of gender roles among the officials and field level workers are lacking and this led to several problems. Lack of women's participation in coordination committees led to the women's needs remaining unmet. This is evident in the traditional Panchayat in fishing communities in Tamil Nadu. Due to the lack of gender research in disaster management, Central, State and Local government adopted a gender-neutral approach. Women were made to be visible in the process of relief and rehabilitation activities as tokens and not in real terms. Women's basic needs also were not even met. The Government officials took down the names of Head of the families mostly men while handing over relief. Therefore gender perspective and participation should not be forgotten in the planning, management and decision making process of the disaster cycle.

1. Check your progress Exercise 1

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. What does Gender Blind Approach refers to?

2. Give examples of gender neutral approach.

9.4 GENDER BIASED APPROACH

A Gender biased approach means that planning, policies and programmes favour any one of the genders and does not take into account the needs of others. In the patriarchal society women suffer because of a gender-biased approach, since importance is given to men alone.

Is India a gender-biased country? What kind of welfare work have the successive governments have done for the women in the country till date? If we believe the report published by World Economic Forum it says that India is a gender-biased nation and it ranks along with other countries where women have not yet been given their rights in the society. According to the World economic Forum's (WEF) Gender Gap Index Report published recently in 2009, India has been placed at 114th position among 128 countries. The report was published on the basis of women's role in economic, political, social, health and other important areas in these countries. According to the Report, India fared poorly in economic

participation and opportunity and was placed at 122nd position in the list of 128 countries. In the year 2006, India was placed at 98th position in the list of 115 countries. However, it has slipped to 114th position in the new list comprising 128 nations. Sweden ranked at the top place in the list with a gender equality of 81.5% in the country. Sweden is followed by Norway, Finland and Iceland at 2nd, 3rd and 4th place in the list. However, Bahrain, Cameroon, Burkina Faso, Iran, Oman, Egypt, Turkey, Morocco, Benin, Saudi Arabia, Nepal, Pakistan, Chad and Yemen are countries placed below India in the list.

The report says that India has an overall 59.4% gender equality, and for economic participation and opportunity the ratio goes down to 39.8%. However, in political empowerment, India ranks at 21st with 106 women in parliament, 118 in ministerial positions. At the same time, India ranked at 4th place with 43% gender equality when talked about in terms of female head of state. At present, women are enjoying greater participation in the political system in comparison with other areas. The President of India is a woman; the chairperson of the ruling coalition is a woman. Women are enjoying power in different states. However, if we talk about the social and financial conditions of women living in rural India and several parts of urban India, we can find that they are still surrounded by the people opposing freedom to women in society.

However in the world wide analysis relative to their population share, women are under-represented in political leadership positions. In July 2010, women comprised only 19.2% of all parliament members in the world. This gender gap in political representation coexists with a well established gender gap in political views: women and men have different policy preferences with women more likely to support liberal policies, in particular spending on child care and other child related expenses . Evidence also suggests that compared to income or assets in the hands of men, income or assets in the hands of women raise spending on

education, health, nutrition and other expenditures benefiting women and children. Increasing women's income also leads to higher survival rates for children and larger improvements in child health. Taken together, these facts would indicate that the policy decisions made by the world's predominantly male policymaking bodies may not reflect the policy priorities of women, including the well-being of children. Recognizing this fact, many governments are taking active steps to encourage the participation of women in policy making, notably by establishing quotas for women in parliaments or in local governments. Quotas for women in assemblies or on parties' candidate lists are in force in the legislation of over 81 countries. While reservation policies clearly have a strong impact on women's representation, the fact that women and men may have different policy preferences need not imply that increased female representation will affect policy decisions. In a world where candidates care about electoral success and can commit to policies before elections, voter preferences, rather than the legislator's gender identity, will determine policy outcomes. Further, if men and women are equally likely to vote and monitor elected officials, the implemented policies should not exhibit any gender bias. Even if mandated political representation raises the bargaining power of women, increased female representation in politics should only affect transfers to women, not policy, as long as the preferences of different voters are known and individuals are not credit constrained. That is, the efficient policy choices will still be made, and women will be compensated with direct transfers. In these two worlds, we will see no impact of the gender of the policymaker on policy decisions, including policy decisions regarding women and children.

Box 2: Emergence of Gender Bias in traditional Scandinavian communities:

In Saami society, men and women have, each in their own way, been bearers of culture, though women carried the greater share because they had the responsibility for raising the

next generation. As the Saami became more strongly integrated into the majority society, the state decided that the rights to occupations should be tied to men. This was based on the European idea of the man as breadwinner and thus the person economically responsible for the family, despite the fact that agriculture had once been the responsibility of the women of Sápmi. Saami women in reindeer communities formerly held a relatively stronger position than women in the majority society because of their participation in reindeer breeding. A woman owned the reindeer that she brought with her into her marriage. The state's management and laws brushed aside the position Saami women traditionally had, effectively weakening their position in relation to men. This experience of state legislation undermining indigenous women's rights is also described for the Maori in New Zealand. Prior to European settlement, Maori women could own land and had an equal voice in decision-making. However this was eroded with the arrival of European settlers and the imposition of a patriarchal western-based system which gave males/husbands the principal role in land transactions. This is condemned as "...a system which had as its sole objective to bring Maori land under an individualistic, patriarchal system." This highlights another aspect of gender bias, this time from within the community itself. With the exception of matriarchal societies, the majority of indigenous communities follow patrilineal lines along the male line, with women stepping in only in the absence of a male heir. This has significant impact on women's socio-economic and financial security and contributes to her vulnerability.

9.5 RIGHTS BASED APPROACH

A Rights based approach aims at promoting and protecting human rights based on international human rights standards. It serves as a conceptual framework in the process of human development. Discriminatory practices, inequalities, unjust distribution of power are

some of the factors which serve as hurdles in the wholistic and inclusive development process. A Rights based approach seeks to analyze these problems which impede progress of development. Under a human rights-based approach, the plans, policies and processes of development are anchored in a system of rights and corresponding obligations are established by international law. This helps to promote the sustainability of development work, empowering people themselves— especially the most marginalized—to participate in policy formulation and hold accountable those who have a duty to act. While there's no universal recipe for a rights-based approach, international organizations and rights-based organizations have come together to fight for the rights of deprived and marginalized communities. Based on this, advocacy is being done to develop policies and programmes to fulfill human rights.

This approach talks about two components, one is rights-holders and another is duty-bearers. Right holders are people, whose entitlements in all forms is considered as their rights and duty-bearers like machineries of the state have the responsibility to provide and protect the entitlements of rights-holders. It is the obligatory role of the duty-bearers to work towards strengthening the capacities of the rights-holders. A rights-based approach to development and gender mainstreaming are complementary and mutually reinforcing, and can be undertaken without conflict or duplication. Gender mainstreaming calls for the integration of a gender perspective in the development activities, with the ultimate goal of achieving gender equality. A rights-based approach integrates international human rights standards and principles in development activities, including women's human rights and the prohibition of sex discrimination. The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women has analysed comprehensively and in depth how inequality affects women's lives; this is a valuable input for development policymaking and programming. When backed by national accountability systems, the rights-based approach can greatly reinforce progress towards gender equality. Gender mainstreaming and rights-based approach to development have

much in common. Both rely on an analytical framework that can be applied to all development activities (for the former, the different situation experienced and roles played by men and women in a given society; and for the latter, a normative framework based on entitlements and obligations). Both call attention to the impact of activities on the welfare of specific groups, as well as to the importance of empowerment and participation in decision-making. Both apply to all stages of activity (design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation) and to all types of action (legislation, policies and programmes). Finally, both require the systematic adoption of new and different approaches to existing activities, as distinct from developing new and additional activities. In most organizations, gender mainstreaming is a more familiar concept than human rights mainstreaming. Structures and processes set up to ensure gender mainstreaming can be emulated or adapted to facilitate the introduction of a human rights-based approach to programming more generally. But, equally, there is a need to learn from situations where gender mainstreaming has failed. If staff perceives mainstreaming gender (or human rights) as a bureaucratic or technical requirement without real implications for their own work, and if internal incentive structures are weak and lines of accountability unclear, the approach may have no impact.

Box 3: A Gender and Rights-Based Journey of the Positive Women Network

(PWN+)

In 1998, 18 positive women came together to form the Positive Women Network (PWN+) in the southern Indian State of Tamil Nadu to fight the circumstances that had led to their status. The impetus that led to the formation of this organization came from P. Kousalya - the present President of PWN+ - who decided to defy social disapproval and go public about the fact that her husband knew about his positive status prior to marriage. Feeling angry and cheated, she filed a case with the local police and sent a petition to the district

collector's office. However, there was no support forthcoming for her cause; it was thus that she took the unprecedented step of going to the media with her story - a successful step that made her realize that there were others like her struggling to cope with their newly acquired status of a woman living with HIV/AIDS in the country and who could use the tools of advocacy, campaign and lobbying to bring their issues to public policy domain.

Other members of the network have had traumatic experiences - Rani (not her real name), a trained nurse, was demoted to a low skilled job as "punishment" for her status; Heena, a 27-year old mother of three, was sent back to her natal home after her status became known. Sara was deprived of her property rights by her in-laws.

Commitments to a Rights-Based Response to HIV/AIDS

The key outcomes of the Consultation were the setting up of several critical commitments and action points rooted in rights-based principles:

- *Right to information on the availability of treatment and affordable drugs that are easily available in urban and rural areas;*
- *Promotion of women –friendly reproductive health services in the public and private sector and building of skills among health care providers, especially among gynecologists on the prevention of Mother to Child Transmission;*
- *Counseling services that are sensitive to the needs of women;*
- *Increase awareness and skills in legal literacy;*
- *Facilitate networking and advocacy with different stakeholders such as the judiciary, law enforcement agencies, and women's and human rights groups;*
- *Address stigma and discrimination;*
- *Increase access to micro-credit programmes and welfare schemes for WLHAs;*
- *Document success stories and life experiences of positive women and establish role models*

for WLHAs; and,

- *Solicit Greater Involvement of People Living with HIV/AIDS (GIPA) – including involving and seeking recommendations from WLHAs in various committees.*

Source: P. Kousalya et al, Using Rights-Based Processes Towards Building Gender-Sensitive, The UNIFEM South Asia Partnership with the Positive Women Network, India and Centre for Advocacy and Research in India Responses for Women Living with HIV/AIDS: The UNIFEM South Asia Partnership with the Positive Women Network, India and Centre for Advocacy and Research in India, 2005

To improve the lives of the poor, marginalized and other deprived communities, India recently has enacted legislations from a rights-based perspective. Recent rights-based legislation has certainly improved on previous development efforts. The right-to-information, the right-to-education, Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act are some of them which has rights-based perspective.

9.6 GENDER POSITIVE APPROACH

While gender equality is an important goal in itself – an issue of human rights and social justice – efforts to promote greater equality between women and men can also contribute to the achievement of other social and economic objectives. It has been clear for decades that women in many parts of the world make key contributions in areas of development such as agriculture and water resources management. Neglecting women in these areas has often led to less than optimal effects of development inputs, and at worst negative impacts. In other sectors it is becoming increasingly clear that development goals will not be met unless the needs and priorities of all stakeholders are identified and addressed. Even in areas where gender perspectives were normally considered irrelevant, such as trade

and macroeconomics, it is increasingly recognized that sound developments must be based on a clear assessment of the contributions of women as well as men and the potential impact of planned interventions on both women and men and on their productivity. There has been a steady accumulation of evidence that gender differences and inequalities directly and indirectly affect the impact of development strategies and hence the achievement of overall development goals.

Persistent differences and disparities between women and men can mean that women have to bear more of the costs of lack of development and gain fewer benefits than men from development interventions. This not only has negative implications for women themselves, but for the society as a whole. Women represent half the resources and half the potential in any society. This potential remains unrealized when women are constrained by inequality and discrimination. “The empowerment and autonomy of women and the improvement of women’s social, economic and political status is essential for the achievement of both transparent and accountable government and administration and sustainable development in all areas of life.... Achieving the goal of equal partnership of women and men in decision-making will provide a balance that more accurately reflects the composition of society and is needed in order to strengthen democracy and promote its proper functioning.” (Platform for Action, para 109)

The links between gender equality and effective and sustainable development are clear in some areas, especially areas where both women's and men's roles are very visible, for example in health, education and agriculture. The most well-known example of links between promotion of gender equality and achievement of development goals is in the area of **education**. Research carried out, particularly by the World Bank, has shown that, in many contexts, more equitable access to education by women and girls can give very positive returns in improved family health, greater productivity and reduced family size. Studies in 46

developing countries showed that a one per cent rise in women's literacy had three times the positive effect of a one per cent rise in the number of doctors available. Research on economic growth and education shows that failing to invest in education can lower the Gross National Product (GNP). All other things being equal, countries in which the ratio of female-to-male enrolment in primary or secondary education is less than 0.75 can expect levels of GNP that are roughly 25 per cent lower than countries in which there is less gender disparity in education.

The World Bank has also argued that there are overall **health** gains to be achieved through a strong focus on the specific health needs of women, particularly in the area of reproductive health. Improving women's health is seen to be cost-effective. Greater health for women impacts positively on the health of other family members, especially children. Particular gains are to be had from investing in the health of adolescent girls, since reproductive and other lifestyle behaviours established at this age set the stage for health prospects in later life.

Therefore, a Gender positive approach takes all these aspects into account and policies are framed accordingly. It addresses the lacunae prevailing in gender-neutral and gender-blind approach. It caters to the need of women and men differently and also addresses the structural inequality existing in the society.

Check Your Progress Exercise 2

Note: i. Use the space given below to answer the questions.

ii. Compare your answer with the one given at the end of this unit.

1. Give some examples of rights based approach in India.

2. What is gender positive approach?

9.7 SUMMING UP

The approaches to Gender and Development over a period of time has undergone several changes based on the socio-economic-political situation of the state as well as the interventions of supranational institutions. Women's differential needs were not considered initially but later the gender perspective has altered the whole scenario. The different kinds of approaches like WID, WAD and GAD which you have already studied in the previous Units has taught you the changes that have taken place in the development discourse and in this Unit you have learned about the lacunae in the policies because of the lack of gender perspective. An introduction to rights based approach and gender positive approach has given you an understanding about the need of differential treatment for men and women and it is obligatory for the state to take care of the welfare of their citizens equally to provide a decent standard of living.

9.8 GLOSSARY

Budget: A summary of estimated expenditure for a given period of time along with proposals for financing them.

Substantive Equality: While formal sex equality judges the form of a rule, requiring that it treat women and men on the same terms without special barriers or favors on account of their sex, substantive equality looks to a rule's results or effects. Formal rule equality often does not produce equal results because of significant differences in the characteristics and circumstances of women and men. Advocates of substantive equality demand that rules take account of these differences to avoid gender-related outcomes that are considered unfair. Determining what differences should be taken into account and in what ways -- in short, what is fair -- is not always an easy matter. Thus, substantive equality is not one theory, but several theories, reflecting multiple types and sources of difference and a number of alternative or overlapping substantive ideals.

Disaster: An occurrence causing widespread destruction and distress; a catastrophe.

9.9 ANSWERS TO CHECK YOUR PROGRESS

Check Your Progress Exercise 1:

1. Gender-blindness refers to a failure to identify or acknowledge difference on the basis of gender where it is significant.
2. Budget, structural reform etc.

Check Your Progress Exercise 2:

1. Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Scheme, Right to Information Act, right to education etc
2. Gender positive approach caters to the needs of both women and men in the process of development.

9.10 REFERENCES

Chandra K. Roy , *Indigenous Women: A Gender Perspective*, resource Centre for the Rights of Indigenous People, May 2004.

Emily Esplen, *Engaging Men in Gender Equality: Positive Strategies and Approaches*, Sussex: IDS, BRIDGE, October 2006.

Ether Duflo et.al, *Women Politicians, Gender Bias and Policy Making in rural India*, Background paper, UNICEF, December 2006.

Frequently Asked Questions On A Human Rights-Based Approach To Development Cooperation, New York and Geneva : United Nations, 2006

Human Rights and India, p.16, Yojana, Vol.44 No.12

Human Rights and Women in the New Millienium 'Sukha', the Magazine of Kamala Nehru Mahila Mahavidyala, 04-05.

Manju Senapaty, Paper presented at the Inter-Agency Workshop on Improving the Effectiveness of Integrating Gender Into Government Budgets organised by Commonwealth Secretariat, London, 26-27 April 2000.

Office of the Special Adviser on Gender Issues and Advancement of Women, United Nations,CH March 2001.

Zoë Oxaal with Sally Baden, *Gender and Empowerment: Definitions, approaches and implications for policy*, Sussex:IDS, BRIDGE, October, 1997.
www.uninstraw.org

9.11 QUESTIONS FOR REFLECTION AND PRACTICE

1. Explain the nature of gender-blind and gender-neutral approach.

2. What is the significance of having a gender positive approach in policy making?

3. Analyze the merits of a Rights based approach.